THE EVALUATION OF LOGISTICS WORKFORCE IMPLEMENTATION ON THE INDONESIAN NATIONAL ARMY (TNI) HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT POLICY

Bambang Kustiawan  
State University of Jakarta  
Email: bambangkustiawan_7647157932@mhs.unj.ac.id

Kazan Gunawan  
State University of Jakarta  
Email: kazangunawan@ymail.com

Maruf Akbar  
State University of Jakarta  
Email: maruf.akbar@unj.ac.id

ABSTRACT

The condition of the use of the logistics workforce in the development of human resources of the TNI can still occur imbalances resulting from the aspects that’s not synergized well affecting the improvement of the quality of human resources of the TNI. The purpose of this study is to gather information related to the implementation evaluation results of the use of the logistics workforce in the construction of Human Resources in TNI with its evaluation by using William Dunn policy evaluation with evaluation criteria such as effectiveness, adequacy, alignment, responsiveness and accuracy. The qualitative method is used under the design of case study research. The data was obtained through interview session, with the personnel from TNI Headquarters, especially in the logistics assistant for the TNI Commander and staff, also though the observation and literature review.

This research shows that from the evaluation of the implementation of the logistics workforce usage in the construction of TNI Human Resources in supporting the main tasks of the Indonesian National Army Headquarter with the findings: (1) The effectiveness of the use of logistics workers has a strategic function in achieving the performance of the TNI logistics workforce (2) The efficiency of the use of logistics workforce with diverse contributions, starting from planning, implementation and evaluation of logistical support, (3) Adequacy is interpreted to achieve conducive policy results, (4) Alignment/Justice leads to the issue of balance of results obtained will be comparable to the contribution given, (5) Responsivity cultures optimal service as TNI Logistics Staff, and (6) Accuracy of carrying out work by the respective task areas is in lined with the objectives of the implementation of activities to support the main tasks of the TNI

Keywords: Policy Evaluation, Labor Use, Human Resources Development of the TNI.
INTRODUCTION

The Constitution No. 3 of 2002 on State Defense defined as the all efforts to defend the sovereignty of the state, the integrity of the territory of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia, and the safety of all nations from threats and interference to the integrity of the nation and the state. Then, the constitution No. 34 of 2004 about the TNI article 7 paragraphs (1), states that the main duties of the TNI are to uphold the sovereignty of the state, maintaining the integrity of the territory of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia based on Pancasila and, as well as protecting all Indonesians from threats and disturbances to the integrity of the nation and the state. In order to ensure the successful implementation of the main task of the TNI, the use of the TNI workforce must be increased in terms of the capabilities power, skills by adding science and technological advances, in order to support and meet the needs of units or organizations that have a high risk in the implementation of tasks.

Today's condition of the use of the logistics workforce in the development of TNI human resources may lead to imbalances resulting from the aspects that is not well synergized then affecting the improvement of the quality of human resources of the TNI. The key concept of TNI human resources development is expected to create the balance of all aspects that affect the quality of TNI human resources. TNI human resources coaching includes the construction, maintenance, separation and administration of TNI logistics personnel. The current conditions related to the use of logistics workforce on the construction of TNI human resources namely the provision of personnel still needed to be improved both quality and quantity.

The problems resulted on a lack of maximum readiness and operational materiality to meet the demands of operational and training tasks while fostering and improving skills. TNI logistics staff should have conducted a routine evaluation on every use of its workforce in the human resources coaching of the TNI. The evaluation will also measure the stability of each implementation that has been implemented.

Based on the explanation, it is very important to conduct evaluation research on the implementation of the use of the logistics workforce. Thus, the use of logistical manpower that is directly related to the task of increasing the readiness of defense equipment and TNI materials, including empowering the National Defense industry based on user-oriented and operational requirements. Logistics human resources who are ready to carry out their duties along with the completeness of facilities and infrastructure by prioritizing interoperability, communality and family systems in order to realize efficiency and effectiveness of budget use from planning, procurement, storage and distribution of logistics to supervision and control in supporting TNI's main tasks. From the description above, it can be concluded that if the use of logistics manpower is optimized through the fulfillment of the quality and quantity of human resources, adequate infrastructure, availability of software and coordinated work mechanisms, so the implementation of logistics management can be supported and the TNI's main tasks will be carried out successfully.
LITERATURE REVIEW

Policy Implementation Evaluation Concept

In this literature review, researchers presented the concepts of evaluation of policy implementation, logistics Human Resources coaching theory, evaluation model used, the reason for model selection, and analysis results, which will then be used as material to conduct analysis in the form of a theoretical framework that serves as "theoretical argument" or "conceptual framework". On another occasion, based on the Emzir (2018) said that the existence of theory was vital because the theory was an abstract concept system that identified a relationship between these concepts that helped researchers to understand a phenomenon.

According to Stufflebeam & Coryn (2014), evaluation is a process to provide an independent and competent statement of opinion or consideration of conformity with established criteria for things such as reliability, effectiveness, cost, efficiency, safety, ease, and honesty. Robert (2010) suggests that evaluation is the pursuit of know/edge about value.

Dunn (2014) expressly states the Evaluation has a related meaning, each points to the application of several scales of value to the results of policies and programs, in general, the term evaluation can be likened to appraisal, rating, and assessment, words that state efforts to analyze policy results in the sense of a unit of value.

The Policy of TNI Logistics Workforce usage

Policies usually last long without review and refinement. Policies are a set of concepts and principles that are the guidelines and foundations of a plan in the implementation of a job, leadership, and way of acting and directing actions to achieve goals in ways and instructions that must be followed. More specifically the policy is a guideline for implementing action. Anderson & Buckley (2017) said that "Public policies are those policies developed by governmental bodies and officials."

According to Johannessen J.-A (2018) Policy evaluation is carried out to know about: 1) policymaking process; 2) implementation process; 3) policy consequences and 4) effectiveness of policy impacts. Therefore, public policy evaluations are distinguished in two types. First, the type of outcomes of public policy implementation is research that bases itself on policy objectives. Second, the type of process of public notice implementation, which is evaluation research that bases itself on implementation instructions and technical instructions.

Implementation of The Use of Manpower in The Construction of TNI

Paul & Daniel (2010) argues that "Implementation is the carrying out of basic policy decision, usually incorporated in a statute but which can also take the form of important executives orders or court decisions. Ideally, that decision identifies the problem(s) to be addressed, stipulates the objectives(s) to be persuaded, and, in a variety of ways, 'structures' the implementation process." According to Tachjan (2006), that Implementation as a public policy is a process of administrative activities carried out after the policy is established / approved.

Research related to the evaluation of employee coaching policies is interesting to be reviewed. Blucer (2015), stated that "Evaluation of Individual Performance Management Policy examination of The Financial Examiner Board of the Republic of Indonesia (case study: at BPK RI provincial representative DKI. Jakarta)". The results of the study consisted of facts found and discussions containing the researchers' decisions on the facts that had been analyzed based on the appropriate criteria, then obtained conclusions and produced recommendations containing suggestions for improving the quality of the policies studied.
Signé (2017) stated that implementation focused on how one can produce change through special interventions. The main challenge in dealing with policy issues was analytical. Policy success in realizing policy changes is determined by the capacity to work against different types of uncertainty. Walker in his research entitled Policy transfer in a corporatist context: Agents, adjustments and continued innovation (Walker, 2019), stated that collaboration was an increasingly important pathway in the development of policy reform and innovation.

**Model of Evaluation of Labor Use Implementation in Human Resources Development of TNI**

According to William Dunn, the evaluation includes factors: effectiveness, efficiency; adequacy (accuracy in answering problems); equity, responsiveness, and appropriateness. These needs include achieving significant goals, priorities, and assessments of outcomes. For this purpose, the input is needed, namely an assessment of alternative approaches that can be used for fulfillment by way of program planning and allocation of resources. In this case, the process in the evaluation serves to assess the implementation of the planning to get to the activities, then explain the results achieved.

Based on the results of the researcher's analysis, the selected evaluation model is the Dunn evaluation model (2014). This model is in lined with the characteristics of HR Logistics Coaching. William Dunn's Evaluation Model has a holistic approach to evaluation, aimed at providing a very detailed and broad picture of the recruitment program, from its context to the implementation process and helping to make improvements during the program, as well as providing final information. Thus, William Dunn's evaluation model in its implementation is more widely used by evaluators. The selection of the evaluation of this implementation is as follows: 1) Fulfillment of the provisions of the law and its implementation regulations, 2) Measuring the effectiveness and efficiency of the program, 3) Measuring the influence, side effects of the program, 4) Accountability of the implementation of the program, 5) Accreditation of the program, 6) The tool of controlling the implementation of the program, 7) The means of communication with the program stakeholders, 8) Decision-making regarding the program whether it is continued, changed, repaired, and discontinued.

**Table 1**

**Evaluation Approach**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Approach</th>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Assumption</th>
<th>Main Forms</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pseudo</td>
<td>Use descriptive methods to generate valid information about policy results</td>
<td>The benefit measure or value is self-evident or not controversial</td>
<td>Social experiment system accounting social examination research and practice synthesis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formal</td>
<td>Using descriptive methods to produce reliable and valid information about policy results formally announced as the goal of policy programs.</td>
<td>The Goals and objectives of policy makers and administrators who are officially announced is an appropriate measure of benefit or value.</td>
<td>Development evaluation, experiment evaluation, retrospective process evaluation, retrospective evaluation of results.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approach</td>
<td>Objectives</td>
<td>Assumption</td>
<td>Main Forms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluation of theoretical decisions</td>
<td>Using descriptive methods to produce reliable and valid information about the policy outcomes explicitly desired by various policy actors.</td>
<td>Formally or tacitly announced goals and objectives of various actors are precise measures of benefit or value.</td>
<td>Judgements about whether or not they can be evaluated multi-attribute utility analysis.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


The criteria set forth as a benchmark in determining whether or not a policy is successful. Dunn's opinion on the criteria can be explained as follows:

a. Effectiveness concerning whether an alternative achieves the expected outcome (consequences) or achieves the objective of the implementation of action. Effectiveness, which is closely related to technical rationality, is always measured by the unit of its product or service or monetary value.

b. Efficiency concerns the amount of effort required to produce a certain level of effectiveness. Efficiency, which is a synonym for economic rationality, is the relationship between effectiveness and effort, the latter generally measured by monetary costs.

c. Adequacy concerns how far a level of effectiveness satisfies the needs, values or opportunities that foster problems. The adequacy criteria emphasize the strong relationship between policy alternatives and expected outcomes.

d. Equity is closely related to legal and social rationality and points to the distribution of consequences and efforts between different groups in society. These alignment-oriented policies are policies that are consequently (e.g., monetary) or business (e.g., monetary costs) are fairly distributed.

e. Responsiveness concerns how far a policy can satisfy the needs, preferences, or values of a particular community. Responsiveness criteria are important because analysts who can satisfy all other criteria of effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, alignment still fail if they have not responded to the actual needs of the group that should benefit from the absence of a policy.

f. The appropriateness of the accuracy criteria is closely related to substantive rationality, as the question of policy accuracy does not concern individual criteria units but two or more criteria together. Accuracy refers to the value or price of the purpose of the program to the strong assumptions that underlying those objectives.

**RESEARCH METHOD**

The place or location in this study is focused on the Environment of The Indonesian National Army Headquarter, Cilangkap, which represents the conditions of use of Logistics Human Resources in conducting the process of Evaluating the Human Resources Development Policy of the TNI. The implementation of research was carried out from December 2019 to May 2020, data collection in the form of interviews, observations, and research subjects selected purposively according to the needs and topics selected on the environment site. This research is intended to find out how to evaluate the implementation of the use of manpower in the TNI Logistics Human Resources Development Policy in supporting the main tasks in the Indonesian National Army Headquarter. Therefore, the research method used is qualitative, namely understanding something from a part of human social life based on a holistic and complex picture;
processed through words; recording, interpreting, and conveying the informant's views in detail, conducted naturally, which by several individuals or groups of people is considered to stem from Cresswell's social or humanitarian problems (1994). Purposive Informant Determination Technique, in which the informant is selected according to the needs and objectives of the research to obtain the necessary data. They are logistics assistant for the TNI Commander and staff who have accurate information about the implementation of the use of logistics workforce based on the consideration of the authority, have a lot of information, and have a connection, both individually and institutionally, with the Implementation of the use of logistics workforce in the TNI Human Resources Development Policy. The data then compared with the various sources of data to strengthen the stance of the data obtained.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The results of this study show that in supporting the basic tasks of the TNI requires the availability of quality human resources to support the availability of materials that are appropriate, precise, and targeted. About the evaluation of the implementation of the use of TNI logistics workforce, concerning Dunn's opinion (2014), there are 6 (six) criteria that must be met, namely: (1) Effectiveness, (2) Efficiency, (3) Adequacy, (4) Equity, (5) Responsiveness, (6) Appropriateness. The six things are interconnected in the patterns and systems that the author describes in the following description:

Effectiveness Aspects

TNI Logistics staff are required to always be appropriate, targeted, on time, and the spot because the availability of adequate logistics personnel is essential for logistics staff. The effectiveness of the logistics workforce is tailored to the ideal workload, work capability, and uptime. In general, the goal has been achieved, but on the other hand, there needs to be improved such as the coordination between the TNI AD Organizational Unit, the Navy, and the Air Force as the Head of The TNI force.

Efficiency Aspects

The efficiency aspect is meant to know how much effort is needed to achieve the desired results. In this study, efficiency was interpreted as an effort in the form of support provided by stakeholders and other relevant parties towards the implementation of the Decree of the Commander-in-Chief of the Indonesian National Army No. 19, dated April 20, 2005, on the Basic Instructions for The Construction of manpower and manpower of the Indonesian National Army. The result of deepening the efficiency aspect is certainly supportive of the enactment of policies on the development of manpower and human resources of the Indonesian national army. The efficiency aspect can also be considered where they support the policy on personnel who are involved in the use of the logistics workforce because of the policy as a rule to regulate the structuring, human resources coaching of the TNI. The results revealed that in general, all informant groups support the enactment of policies on the development of manpower and manpower of the Indonesian national army. Contributions are tailored to the infrastructure of various forms of support provided, ranging from preparing planning, implementation, and evaluation of logistical support. The efficiency of the use of labor to avoid inefficient waste of costs and the productivity of the TNI support logistics.

Adequacy Aspect

Aspects of adequacy to observe how far policy results go in solving problems. In this study, interpreted as a form of policy leaders in determining the achievement of policy results in solving
labor problems such as the implementation of this policy can realize a conducive labor source climate, thus providing positive results to logistical support in supporting the basic duties of the TNI. In this case, it is focused on meeting the need for exercise and surgery. Aspects of adequacy with informant representatives have a positive impact on the progress of distribution development and logistical support. evaluation of the implementation of the use of labor in the human resources policy of the TNI.

In supporting the main task of the TNI aspects of the adequacy of the logistics workforce becomes a very important element by the quality and quantity of work in the preparation of material supplies for the operation of the TNI so that the implementation of the use of labor in the policy by the workload assigned so that logistics support becomes optimal and targeted.

Alignment/Justice Aspects
To see to what extent logistical support in the framework of TNI operations duties evenly to different groups for border areas and outer islands. For this, William N. Dunn provides a reference to more criteria leading to the issue of balance or equalization in terms of receiving benefits in the field of economics. This research is interpreted as an aspect of preparedness of TNI combat operations, where the workforce that fills the field of logistics of the TNI can prepare and distribute according to the needs of operation both for Military Operations of War and Military Operations in addition to war. The equity aspect of this study gives an idea that the results obtained will be comparable to the contribution given in logistics support activities.

Aspects of Responsivities
This aspect is intended to monitor the results of labor use policy that can satisfy the needs Logistics of TNI. In this case, it is interpreted as conformity between the policy objectives and the wishes, needs, or choices of stakeholders or the groups themselves. The suitability of the use of logistics workforce with the implementation of activities both implicit and explicit, where the performance of logistics workforce is better by the principles, rules, and policies of human resources coaching of the TNI with evidence of a strategic plan in the form of annual reports in the form of evaluation and plan of work and budget programs. From the responsiveness aspect of the use of logistics workforce seeks to respond and culture optimal service as a TNI Logistics Staff in charge of carrying out staff functions in the field of TNI logistics coaching, logistical support in the framework of coaching and use of force, as well as assisting the implementation of mobilization and demobilization of material, facilities, and services in the framework of state defense.

Accuracy Aspects
Aspects of accuracy in the use of logistics workforce are the accuracy in carrying out the work by the field of duty of each of them is planning, support for general supplies, equipment, construction, health, transportation, reporting, and logistics training so that there is a suitable between logistics planning and the target or objective stipulated namely the implementation of logistics activities, both to support the development activities of the ranks unit and in the framework of the use of TNI force.

One of the previous study by Peter Cathy S & Helen De Cieri (2015) stated that the retention to training, capacity building, career management and team development indicated the lower allocation to the human resources that make their lack accuracy in working.

CONCLUSION
Based on the results of the analysis and discussion that has been presented, the following conclusions are obtained: (1) The effectiveness of the use of logistics workers has a strategic function in achieving the performance of the TNI logistics workforce optimally in accordance with
the duties, functions and objectives, (2) The efficiency of personnel who are reviewed in the use of logistics workforce in general support for the enactment of policies on human resources development of the TNI with diverse contributions, ranging from preparing planning, implementation and evaluation of logistical support, (3) Adequacy of the use of logistics workforce is interpreted as a form of leadership policy in determining the achievement of policy results in solving labor problems by realizing a workforce source climate conducive to adjusting the coaching budget, thus providing positive results in supporting the main duties of the TNI, (4) Equalization/Justice of the use of logistics workforce more leads to the issue of balance or equalization interpreted as aspects of operational preparedness that provide an overview that the results obtained will be comparable to the contribution made in logistics support activities, (5) Responsiveness of the use of logistics workforce seeks to respond to and culture optimal service as TNI logistics staff in charge of organizing logistics support in order to foster and use force, and assist in the implementation of mobilization and demobilization of materials, facilities and services in the framework of state defense, and (6) The accuracy of the use of logistics workforce in carrying out work in accordance with their respective areas of duty include planning, support for general supplies, equipment, construction, health, transportation, reporting and logistics development so that there is a suitable between planning and objectives i.e. the implementation of activities in order to use the power of the TNI.

REFERENCES

Analysis. Institute of Governmental Affairs, University of California.
Undang Undang Dasar RI, (1945).