



## Transformation of Tolerance Values (in Religion) in Early Childhood Education

Tjipto Sumadi<sup>1</sup>

*Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia*

Elindra Yetti<sup>2</sup>

*Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia*

Yufiarti<sup>3</sup>

*Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia*

Wuryani<sup>4</sup>

*Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia*

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.21009/JPUD.132.13>

Accepted: August 15<sup>th</sup>2019. Approved: September 4<sup>th</sup>2019. Published: 30<sup>th</sup> November 2019

**ABSTRACT:** Religious tolerance is a supporter of social harmony and brings a country to a better life. Instilling tolerance in early childhood is a challenge for early childhood educators. This study aims to describe the transformation of religious tolerance values by teachers in early childhood education. This research is a type of qualitative case study research model with researchers as observer participants. This research produces the following findings, that (1) transformation of tolerance values among religious communities, is explicitly not taught in Early Childhood Education (ECE) on the grounds that all students are of the same religion, (2) transformation of tolerance of values among religious students taught through learning integrated with other lessons, (3) although explicitly the values of tolerance among religious students are not taught, but the values of togetherness such as greeting, sharing something that is owned, and helping the needs of other students are taught by practicing at the same time.

**Keywords:** Early Childhood Education, Tolerance Values in Religion

**e-ISSN (Online Media): 2503-0566**

**P-ISSN (Print Media): 1693-1602**

---

<sup>1</sup> Corresponding Author:  
Email: [tjsumadi@unj.ac.id](mailto:tjsumadi@unj.ac.id)

## 1 INTRODUCTION

Indonesia's reputation for tolerance stems from a long history of religious diversity. Hundreds of local religions and six or seven world religions have lived side by side in the Indonesian archipelago which consists of 17,000 islands for hundreds of years. However, in recent years, tensions have risen between religious and ethnic groups in Indonesia, resulting in conflicts and cases of religious based violence. This development raises the question of how to resolve the decline in religious tolerance.

Recent studies have shown that education is one of the most effective ways to prevent intolerance (UNESCO, 2015). The transformation of the values of religious knowledge is the key to combating intolerance and stereotyping (Scheiner, 2015, p. 142). Increased awareness that 'religious literacy' can give to foster religious understanding and tolerance (Moore, 2007). Religious literacy is defined as the ability to distinguish and analyse the fundamental intersections of religion and social / political / cultural life through various lenses. According to (Moore, 2007) the consequences of religious illiteracy are very deep and include triggering cultural wars, limiting historical and cultural understanding, and promoting religious and racial bigotry. Schools play a fundamental role in preparing early childhood for the realities of life in plural societies and inevitable encounters with 'other' cultures (Miedema & Bertram-Troost, 2008).

Childhood studies emphasize children's agency, their ability to understand their own world and act upon it. Children actively participate in meaningful social interactions in both formal and informal environments. Children interact in an increasingly diverse world where they face cultural and religious differences (Faas, Smith, & Darmody, 2018). Students express a preference for whole class learning rather than a "belief-specific" approach that is done in their first years. Children enjoy learning about other religious beliefs and what their friends will celebrate and believe. Some children express a preference for mixed classes, because separate lessons often eliminate them from their classmates. For many children, mixed classes also provide them with tools to deal with differences and an increasingly diverse world. One solution to instilling moral values is to combine the best approaches over the past few decades. The Comprehensive Value Education Model is progressive and includes all content, methodology, and applications throughout the school and community (Kirschenbaum, 2019).

Childhood religious experiences with peers are important in the development of religiosity. However, the influence of peers on this experience has not been operationalized and measured properly. Tratner et al., (2017) overcame this limitation by developing research on Children's Religious Experience with Peer Inventory (CREPI). The study also measured the influence of peers on childhood religious experiences, allowing for future investigations whether and how these influences predict religiosity as they mature.

Religious education is a field that requires pedagogical education, teacher skills are needed to transform religious values in children, because there is no universal method to systematically incorporate religious principles into children's education. Teachers must also have greater sensitivity and empathy, and also deep religious beliefs, which are reflected in their behavior and the way they relate to students (Ene & Barna, 2015).

Early childhood education is a comprehensive effort, with several educational policies including spiritual development as part of the approach. However, research exploring the spirituality of early childhood is still scarce, which limits understanding of the phenomenon and its full

application in the educational environment. Furthermore, maintaining children's spiritual development is a complex problem, coupled with a variety of factors, no less lack of clarity about what spirituality is. Adams, Bull, & Maynes, (2016) examines the possible spiritual characteristics of children. Efforts to define spirituality before then reviewing how the concept is conceptualized in the broader literature, and then in the literature on early childhood.

Based on previous research, the gap analysis in this study is to see how teachers transform religious tolerance values to early childhood, because tolerance values, are increasingly eroded due to the penetration of global values that sometimes conflict with values that are believed. This phenomenon tends to occur in people who live in urban areas. Tolerance is required for every citizen or among followers of religion which are basic provisions for the integrity of the nation and state. The purpose of this study is to find out how teachers change the values of tolerance among adherents of religion into small children who become students in kindergartens.

## 2 THEORITICAL STUDY

### 2.1 *Religiosity in Early Childhood Education*

Religious beliefs originate and what makes people believe in occult matters remains an open question in the science of religion. Contemporary theories that explain religion usually focus on developing biological dispositions or social factors. Łowicki & Zajenkowski, (2019) is interested in how individual differences in empathic emotional care and social learning mechanisms are exposed to credible religious actions during childhood interactions to predict religion. It was revealed that being exposed by credible religious actions explained more differences in religiosity than empathy. Overall, these findings indicate that there are at least two independent factors associated with the emergence of religious beliefs. One is an individual's tendency to feel other-oriented emotions, while the other is a social factor that is exposed to credible religious models during one's parenting. This shows the importance of religious values instilled early on both at home and at school.

Religion holds certain values as more important than others and is often a container for spreading specific values among followers. Religiosity as a definition of self, and not as spirituality or as a specific value. A meta-analysis of studies conducted in 15 different countries involving three main monotheistic religions (Christianity, Judaism, and Islam) examined the relationship between values and religiosity. In all three religions, reliability can be said to involve a sense of belonging to the religious community and participation in religious activities. Meta-analysis concludes that religious people consider Conservation values to be more important and Openness values to change are not too important. Religiosity is also associated, albeit weak, with higher virtues and lower values of self-improvement, and lower universalism (although the latter effect is very small and is related to certain countries). This study defines religiosity more broadly than religious participation, as a combination of the importance given to God in one's life, and the frequency of individual and family prayers (Uzefovsky, Döring, & Knafo-Noam, 2016).

The challenge of globalization places character education as an important part of realizing quality human beings. Efforts to improve the nationalist and religious character in the Nasima Center are carried out through a process of intervention and habituation. Character education is carried out in three domains. First, the development of nationalist character values and religious tolerance integrated into teaching and learning activities. The second domain, integrating character educa-

tion with extracurricular activities and school culture. The third domain involves student guardians to help build homes that are in line with those developed at school (Yulianti, Sutarto, & Sugiyo, 2019). Ergun & Rivas, (2019) found that social roles, religiosity, and values were important determinants. Mothers who have early childhood are important to raise concerns about changing times and have a more egalitarian and post materialistic outlook. Bano & Ferra, (2018) findings support the hypothesis that parental education, especially maternal education, is the key to modernizing religious and cultural norms in conservative societies.

Children five to 7 years like teleological explanations, but this preference decreases with age. Children aged 5 to 7 years and 8 to 10 years also find teleological explanations more useful than adults. Therefore, understanding the purpose in life events is rooted in childhood, which has the potential to reflect more general sensitivity to religious tolerance (Banerjee & Bloom, 2015).

Granqvist & Nkara, (2017) considers the effect of cultivation (including culture) on the developing psychological tendencies expressed in religious and spiritual development. An integrated understanding of the development of religious and spiritual requires sides (nurture-or-nurture) and additives (natures + nurture) by the teacher. The development of religious and spiritual has been understood as an expression of a developing cognitive module (nature) on the one hand, and socialization and social learning (nurture) on the other hand, or in similar additive terms (for example, nature produces brain / mind, culture fills in the details). Heiphetz, Lane, Waytz, & Young, (2016) points out that children's religious cognition often fits in with the implicit response of adults, revealing anthropomorphic ideas about God's mind.

Often in conservative religious populations, fantastic thinking, interests, and beliefs are not recommended because fantastic beliefs are considered to be contrary to religious doctrine. However, belief in unseen and omnipotent entities such as God and Santa Clauses tend to rely on similar conceptual abilities that might complement rather than conflict with religion. Therefore, Thibodeau, Brown, Nancarrow, Elpers, & Gilpin, (2018) examines how one's current fantasy orientation and retrospectives are related to religious orientation. The findings show cultural concern that childhood games and fantastic thinking can damage or contradict religious doctrine. This finding has important implications for understanding how religiosity and fantasy are conceptually related, as well as how cultural practices can influence conceptual development.

To study children's religious tolerance at the beginning of the twenty-first century provides a major opportunity to explore personal, social and global relationships in spiritual understanding and practice. Countless definitions of diversity have been studied, but it is also said that the value of religion is often unclear. King, (2013) suggests an open description that can be applied to childhood where the fabric of human life first appeared, fostered into further growth and shaped into adult expression. Spirituality that is fostered well in childhood or adolescence is closely related to the development of spiritual potential in adulthood. Scott, (2014) research results look at critical and constructive educational responses and corrections for every aspect of religious education mosaic. It advocates the reuse of religion, institutions, and traditions as indispensable for reopening access to children to participate in social spaces and learn tolerance with differences.

## *2.2 Religious Tolerance Values in Early Childhood*

Studying an understanding of religious tolerance among students is very important for the continuity of community peace in the future. Firdaus, (2018) research results show that there is a ten-

dency for students to increase their religious tolerance when they understand the meaning of religious tolerance in the teachings of Islam as exemplified in history by the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH). Some other students are intolerant in religion because they are more likely to be religious exclusively with a legal style ideology that only chooses black or white choices over truth. These results indicate that students generally can understand good religious tolerance during an investigation when they understand the true Islamic inclusiveness of various religious societies.

Religious education can be considered important for the development of a tolerant society. The education system is one of the main institutional structures that maintain the value of intolerance. Increasing tensions based on religious belief in many multicultural societies, this is the right time to review educational assumptions and practices. The state education system centralizes the curriculum to ensure that all children receive adequate religious education (Coleman & Eds, 2011).

The need for tolerance not only increases because of the epidemic of hatred, but also because of daily social interactions that require treating each other with respect and dignity. (Religious) intolerance is most often reflected in insults in classrooms, aisles and playgrounds, outbursts of anger, social clicks, rejection and dismissal of the perspectives of others during class discussions (Van Der Walt, 2014). Tolerance is not the only way to deal with differences, nor is it always the most appropriate way. Sometimes there may be good reasons not to tolerate certain forms of behavior or practices, and sometimes only "tolerance" can be considered inadequate because it requires negative evaluation and forms of rejection of identities and practices that appear to be valuable and worthy of recognition to others. To map the conceptual space where "tolerance" can be placed as a way to engage with differences, researchers in the ACCEPT pluralism project have developed a threefold concept, temporarily called "accept". It distinguishes between spaces of intolerance, one tolerance and one outside tolerance and where differences are handled on the basis of equality, respect and recognition (Maussen et al., 2012).

Maturity of social, emotional and cognitive skills is needed for the development of tolerance. (Lehtonen, 2019) research illustrates the development of identity skills that lead to tolerant behavior. Variations in the way children of various ages show tolerance in their conversation behavior. The reluctance to disagree and deal with others among early childhood contrasts with more frequent and direct quarrels. Despite differences of opinion, children show the ability to work towards solutions and respect each other's views. An environment of collaboration with opportunities for dialogue and negotiation can encourage tolerant behavior and promote learning about procedural tolerance. Collaborative contact with other people who have different beliefs is very important in this regard. Identifying students' religious and non-religious backgrounds and giving them the opportunity to discuss their beliefs in an inclusive and respectful environment, can increase children's self-esteem, create trust, and show them how to deal with diversity and difference. However, these skills are all needed to live in a multicultural democratic society in which schools must prepare children.

Religious education emerged as an important dimension / component of education with important effects on the moral health of the nation, and as a factor influencing human well-being (Niculescu & Norel, 2013). Cultivating religious tolerance at an early age is important, to instill awareness in children of different beliefs in society. School programs in religious tolerance can be presented in various forms of certain attitudes learning indicators that contain tolerance values. It is very important for individuals to develop a tolerant view of culture other than their own in order to function well in a peaceful society. Teaching fundamental values, principles and attitudes about tolerance at an early age can help in achieving this goal. Atamturk, (2018) found that children

basically have positive perceptions about tolerance and tolerance education needs to be developed at an early age to help good people in social life.

The studies conducted above have produced a number of findings, namely; the meaning of high tolerance among religious believers is that there is no open conflict between religious believers, even among adherents of good cooperation. The occurrence of the view that religion and beliefs are the personal affairs of each that gives birth to an awareness of mutual respect and the realization of an agreement not to interfere with each other's beliefs. Tolerance appears in various forms, including participation in rituals, community service, mutual assistance in celebrations, mixed marriages, and visiting each other when someone is sick. There are also a number of motivating factors for mutual tolerance, among others, the existence of a marriage culture between different adherents, socialization of tolerance in the family, and village leadership that emphasizes the importance of tolerance.

Sari & Indartono, (2019) explained the shape multicultural based education with various aspects of diversity. Theology taught tends to only strengthen the faith and attainment of heaven without being accompanied by dialogue with other religions. This condition sometimes causes intolerance. Although there needs to be a philosophical-paradigmatic reorientation about how to build multicultural, humanist, dialogue-persuasive, contextual, substantive, and socially active diversity. In the current postmodern era, aside from religious education, social studies must be used as a place to foster mutual tolerance and maintain harmony. This is because Social Sciences is directly related to social and real problems. Furthermore, there is also what is done in everyday life. Multicultural-based education on the character of religious tolerance with approaches that can be combined with socio-cultural values. This approach is a synthesis in order to face the seeds of intolerance that have begun to grow in the young generation of this nation. Teachers need to teach religious tolerance through social studies education based on a multicultural approach.

The results of research on growing tolerance in early childhood include (1) the addition of a learning plan in fostering an attitude of tolerance for early childhood, contained in the daily plan of activities (DPA), (2) the implementation of learning that refers to the daily plan activity (DPA) made by teachers, (3) the introduction of an introduction program to foster an attitude of tolerance to early childhood which is done through habituation, (4) the growth of tolerance in early childhood.

### 2.2.1 *Tolerance Logic*

In the conventional sense, tolerance refers to the decision to go along or stick with what someone dislikes or disapproves of even when someone has the power to do something about it. Objects of tolerance or things that can be tolerated include various things including beliefs, practices, ideology, religion, ethnicity, social groups and others, and political organizations.

As for subjects or agents of tolerance, that is, those who practice it, they can be individuals, organizations or, more specifically, countries with a monopoly on their physical strength. Tolerance presupposes the following, all of which are closely reviewed and collectively define their conceptual identity.

First of all, the object of tolerance is a concern or interest for us. We believe that other people's trust or way of life or well-being is not our concern, we have no reason to ask how we should respond or what attitude we should take towards them.

Second, because the object of tolerance is thought to concern us, we judge and form a negative view of it. We may not like it, but it is never enough and needs to involve an element of disapproval. As rational beings, we generally want to convince ourselves that our dislike is not irrational or baseless but is based on good reason. In addition, to do something about the object of our dislike, we need support from others, especially the government, which we cannot secure without giving a good reason. Because different people don't like different things, not all of them can be objects of intolerance, they need to show why some dislikes are different and demanding and deserve to act. This is why those who oppose homosexuality don't just say they don't like it; they also argue that it is not natural, parasitic, socially subversive and so on. Likewise, a white racist is rarely satisfied saying that he doesn't like black people. He insisted on the intellectual and moral inferiority they suspected, showing their habits, history, practices and ways of life, and claims to show why they did not deserve to be treated equally.

Third, because disagreement involves judgment, it has a normative basis and presupposes the value or standard on which that assessment is based. Values or standards can claim to be universal in their validity or at least in societies which are objects of tolerance.

Fourth, tolerance presupposes that a person can do something about the object of tolerance, such as prohibiting, prohibiting, persecuting or stopping it, and thus acting on one's disapproval. If one does not have such power, all that can be done is to live with objects that are not approved as bad weather. Tolerance is only possible when intolerance is a choice

Fifth, even though someone has power over the object of tolerance and can forbid or end it, one chooses not to use that power and shows patience or self-control. This creates a problem because allowing it to continue can be easily misinterpreted to approve it, even though it isn't. The agents of tolerance need to clarify this partly to counteract the possibility of criticism from their opponents, partly to limit the expectations of the object of tolerance, and partly to inform the latter that their tolerance is an act of generosity that deserves recipient gratitude. They generally do so by continuing to express their disapproval of it, asking the object of tolerance not to make further demands, and, sometimes punishing tolerant views and practices.

Finally, tolerance presupposes some level of plurality of values. Because this involves self-control, it implies that a person has values that stop someone from acting on their disapproval. Someone may allow unapproved beliefs or practices to continue because someone respects the integrity or autonomy of the agent or believes that trust cannot or at least should not be forced, that physical or legal force must not extend to certain areas, or that peace and civil order don't have to be risky. These values do not rule out initial disapproval, but block or prevent action based on it, and must be clearly different from the one on which the initial disapproval is based. In this case tolerance involves at least a minimum number, which supports the initial disapproval, and which does not allow it. If the first is considered outside pare (Parekh, 2019).

Referring to the accumulation of the above research results, the state of the art and the difference in essence or novelty of the research plan to be carried out is on how teachers instill tolerance values among religious believers in early childhood in big cities whose lives are very complex, such as Jakarta. Thus, it is hoped that this research can complement the existing research treasury, namely the pattern of transformation of tolerance values from teachers to early childhood in kindergartens located in South Jakarta.

Meanwhile, the values of tolerance that will be studied in this study are based on early researched as follows; (1) Attitudes and actions that respect religious differences, (2) Attitudes and actions that respect ethnic differences, (3) Attitudes and actions that respect ethnic differences, (4) Attitudes and actions that respect differences of opinion, (5) Attitudes and actions that respect differences in attitude, (6) Attitudes and actions that respect differences in actions, (7) Respect the rights of others, (8) Respect the obligations of others, (9) Maintain and maintain school facilities, (10) Empathize with natural disaster victims, (11) Participate in the mutual assistance program to guard the school, (12) Respect for the worship of others, (13) Do not force will on others, and (14) Love each other.

### 3 METHODS

#### 3.1 *Participant*

The location of this research was conducted at Al Qorny ECE located on Jl. Barkah II RT. 009 RW. 06 No. 13 Manggarai Selatan, Tebet, South Jakarta 12860. ECE Al Qorny is a product of the activities of the residents of the neighborhood committee. ECE Al Qorny is led by Ms. Yy with her last education graduated from high school. Ms. Yy is assisted by three female teachers who teach 22 students, who are divided into two age groups.

#### 3.2 *Research Design*

This study used descriptive qualitative method. In this research, it is explained and analyzed how the pattern of transformation of tolerance values by teachers to early childhood in East Jakarta and South Jakarta. In this study, researchers acted as instruments and played an active role in digging in depth data information (in depth interviews and probing questions). All data obtained and relevant analyzed as material research wealth.

The research begins with a study of documentation that is relevant to the research material. The next stage is to focus group discussions (FGD) with teachers who teach in kindergarten as reference in East and South Jakarta. It is assumed that in kindergartens the transformation of tolerance values by teachers to early childhood has been carried out. The next step is to prepare an observation and interview guide as an effort to collect research data. Because this type of research is a descriptive qualitative that records, records, and describes events or phenomena that occur at the study site, participatory data collection is used in collecting data. Data collection was carried out in a participatory manner, in which the researchers placed themselves as instruments of life that carried out in-depth interviews with informants and key informants.

This research was conducted at two early childhood education institutions, namely Al Qorny ECE in South Jakarta. Research data were collected by means of documentation studies to assess various actual conditions of tolerance values and their implementation that occur in kindergartens or ECE research targets. The results of the study documentation are referred to at the beginning and end of the study as expert justification.

### 4 RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Al Qorny ECE is included in the category of educational institutions that lack adequate education delivery facilities (ECE). ECE floor is still made of cement plastered soil without ceramics. Study



space is open or without boundaries between one age group and other age groups, so that activities in one group mingle with other study groups. The Al Qorny's ECE Head Room, which is more appropriately referred to as the managing coordinator, also has no meaningful boundaries between the leader's "room" and the study room. The ECE Management Room is also used jointly by the Management Lead and teachers, during breaks.

In terms of the concept of a child-friendly and healthy educational environment, ECE Al Qorny still needs improvement. The floor where children play should be free of dust and clean, so children can play happily but stay healthy. Sanitation also needs to get the attention of managers or other parties who are willing to give attention. This is consistent with Elza, Handini, & Abdurrahman, (2018)'s research that found religiosity encourages positive behaviors such as clean and healthy living behavior. Religious affiliation consisting of individual and community participation and religiosity are priorities and beliefs affecting health risks through attitudes and behavior and social support. Religious factors play a positive role in health behavior that affects one's health risk. This provides an illustration that children who have high religiosity will have a high responsibility also in maintaining health both personal and environmental health. Students with high religiosity are reflected in their knowledge, attitudes, beliefs, and values as a component of the religiosity of each individual.

In terms of educating the managers, the Al Qorny ECE Management Leaders are high school graduates, while three other teachers are 2 diploma graduates (AMd) and one graduate education (S1). Thus, in terms of fairness, the Al Qorny ECE has adequate resources to continue to be developed. In fact, one of the teachers, can teach English to students. The teacher who teaches English is quite skilled and is liked by children. This can be seen from the enthusiasm shown by the children.

This research on tolerance in kindergarten and early childhood education in South and East Jakarta is based on eight dimensions, namely Peace, Openness, Accepting Differences, Reciprocity Award, Affection, Attention, Preservation of the Kindness of Others, and Respect for Others. The eight dimensions of the study are broken down into indicators of actions that can be seen and measured in the implementation of learning in schools. The first dimension is peace which is divided into two indicators, namely providing solutions and expressing friendly tones. The second dimension is openness, which is divided into indicators that take advice and are forthright. The third dimension is to accept differences divided into three indicators which are friends with anyone, not angry when their desires are rejected, and respect the rights of others. The fourth dimension is mutual appreciation divided into two indicators, namely giving congratulations to others and replying to greetings given by other parties to him. The fifth dimension is compassion which is divided into two indicators, namely helping friends and sharing with fellow friends. The sixth dimension is attention, which is only shared by having one indicator, which is feeling happy in togetherness. The seventh dimension is appreciation for the kindness of others. This dimension is also only divided into one indicator, namely mutual counseling or reminding. While the eighth dimension, which is the last dimension, that is appreciation for others is divided into two indicators, namely saying thank you and being able to adjust. The following is an analysis of the findings in the field and their discussion.

The findings in the field, that in transforming the values of tolerance to early childhood, on the dimension of Peace, ECE Al Qorny teachers have not implemented it well. This was reflected in an interview with Ms. Yy (Chair of the Manager) who stated that "a child raised by himself adopts

a solution to the problems he faces". Thus, children do not get direction from the teacher, to find solutions when disputing with their peers.

The phenomenon of teachers who do not transform the values of Peace to early childhood like this, then the child will not have a sense of tolerance to each other, when other children are experiencing difficulties. Supposedly, children get a little help scaffolding from teachers or adults in the vicinity. In that case, children make sounds in a friendly tone, ECE teachers in Al Qorny give less praise. But on the contrary, when the child makes a high-pitched voice that tends to be less friendly, the teacher immediately persuades the child not to shout or lower the tone of voice. Giving less praise to early childhood in doing good deeds, can encourage children to no longer want to do similar acts on other occasions. Vice versa, if the teacher reacts too quickly to the words issued in a high tone, then it tends to make the child seek the teacher's attention.

All early childhood children need the attention of adults around them. Likewise, when children are at school or learning parks or playgrounds, children always seek the attention of adults around them, especially those they know. In this context, the teacher is an adult who is around the child who is following the process of transforming grades in school. For this reason, teachers should give praise to young children who do good deeds, as a form of appreciation or rewards to children. Giving rewards to children will motivate children to continue to do the same kind. Vice versa, if the child when making a high-pitched voice that is less friendly, then the teacher quickly reacts, then this situation will be repeated on another occasion. This is understandable, because children will feel more attention if they do bad deeds, compared to when children have to do good deeds.

The phenomenon that occurs in the second dimension is when a child does an action that is assumed to be less pleasant or disturbs the mutual comfort, then the child being counseled is silent but is not focused on the advice given by the teacher. Even when their peers remind, it also has the same fate, that is, the child does not focus on what is conveyed by his friend. In terms of children's courage to be frank, the phenomenon in Al Qorny ECE shows that children are still lacking the courage to express their opinions. When asked the question how he would feel if he would ask for help from others. Children tend to be quiet and need help from the teacher to answer them. The teacher needs time to persuade the child to be willing to be frank. Theoretically, if an early age child is always given the opportunity to speak candidly, then he will dare to express his opinion. Therefore, early childhood will do something depending on the habituation that occurs in their environment.

That occurs in the third dimension, which is accepting differences. This dimension is divided into three indicators, which are friends with anyone, not angry when their desires are rejected, and respect the rights of others. For the first indicator, which is to make friends with anyone, the phenomenon that occurs in ECE Al Qorny is that children are free to choose friends and without limits. Perhaps, this is caused by a culture that is relatively the same. This is relevant to the experiment with 5452 kindergarten school children from 15 cities, Pandya, (2019) examined the effects of an adjusted spiritual education program on children's quality of life. Results show that religious education in cross-cultural kindergartens has increased the spiritual domain of calmness, silence and calmness; listen; receive; loving nature; and, using radiation, endurance and efficiency in daily functions so that children have a high ability to love and tolerate various differences.

Children will quickly mingle and be friendly with those who naturally have similarities, both skin color, face shape, hair shape, even the height of the body. As for the second indicator, which is not angry when his wishes are rejected, the phenomenon of early childhood in ECE Al Qorny

shows discomfort. Children tend not to be able to accept if their desires are rejected by the teacher. This fact is shown by behavior that opposes the situation, for example by lifting the chair he is sitting on. Meanwhile, on the third indicator, which respects the rights of others, the phenomenon shows that early childhood in Al Qorny, highly respects the rights of others. It appears when a friend's belongings are dropped and then taken and placed in a container on the desk. This shows that early childhood in ECE Al Qorny respect the property of others.

In the fourth dimension, which consists of two indicators, namely giving congratulations to other people who get good luck and return greetings delivered by others to him. The facts show that children are willing to congratulate friends who succeed in pronouncing English words correctly. But when asked if he was willing to say happy holidays to friends of different religions. The child was silent and after being urged he did not dare to say congratulations to friends of different religions. However, for greetings or good morning, good afternoon or the like, children at an early age at Al Qorny are willing to answer.

In terms of saying happy holidays to early childhood who have different religions, it seems not recommended by school leaders. This was revealed when asked to the teacher; whether in ECE is taught tolerance, like saying happy holidays to early childhood who are of different religions. The answer from the teacher was not taught, because those studying at Al Qorny ECE were all followers of the same religion.

The fifth dimension, which consists of helping friends and sharing with fellow friends, can be stated as follows. Empirically, teachers always teach early childhood so that they always help their friends who are having difficulties. This is evident, when one student has difficulty picking up a book, then spontaneously another friend helps get the book. Likewise, with sharing with fellow friends, when the break arrives, one early child brings his food and is offered to his friends. From this fact it appears that the problem of affection and sharing of something owned by the child, becomes a good habit and done correctly. Spiritual experiences or encounters can be intense and impactful moments in a child's life, often shaping their beliefs long into adulthood. They can manifest as occasional but very important events or as more regular events embedded in the routine of daily life. Examples include strong dreams believed to carry divine communication; the appearance of the deceased loved one; encounter with divine beings; permanent friends unseen by others who are usually known as 'imaginary friends'; guardian angels who sit by the child's bed every night to protect them while they sleep; or, for a small minority, near-death experiences. This experience gives strength to children to have moral values because they expect better things that are believed to come from miracles. This moral value brings peace to the child and wants to share peace with peers (Adams, 2019).

The sixth dimension consists of one indicator that is feeling happy in togetherness. The phenomenon that occurs in Al Qorny ECE is that children feel happy learning and playing together with their peers. But when asked if he would be happy too if playing together with peers of different religions, the child just kept quiet. Then with the help of the teacher, he replied that he was happy to also play with friends of different religions. This phenomenon shows that actually in early childhood naturally have a strong sense of respect for others. Therefore, it becomes important if the environment provides an ongoing push for the development of a sense of tolerance in early childhood. This dimension is relevant to the spiritual development of children who are influenced by the people with whom they interact and by the world around them. An important context for young children is kindergarten, which has a high level of responsibility for their (spiritual) education. In kindergarten children meet people with different religious and spiritual

attitudes, which may be fundamental to their own spiritual development. The results of Stockinger, (2019)'s research on how two kindergartens in Austria handle this diversity and how children deal with it are summarized. One result of this qualitative ethnographic research project is that, depending on religion, children have different opportunities to develop their spiritual communication and spirituality based on religious traditions and rituals. Developing kindergarten in accordance with the metaphor of safe spaces where diversity is recognized and discussed can contribute to the creation of equal opportunities for children's spiritual development.

The seventh dimension consists of one indicator, namely mutual respect and reminding fellow friends. The phenomenon in these dimensions and indicators is quite good, because almost every child always reminds one another. With short language, one child reminds other children not to experience unpleasant things. As in the Ganjvar, (2019) research which shows the efficiency and influence of spiritual education on improving the communication behavior of children with followers of other religions through the presentation of Islamic models derived from the Quran and the prophetic tradition. Conceptual analysis of spirituality together with a brief history of attention to the spiritual education of children in the world. As well as introducing an Islamic spiritual model and its foundation and moral aspects. Key factors of the Islamic Model for Religious Education for Children which play an important role in strengthening communication skills of children with non-religion.

The last dimension is the eighth dimension which consists of two indicators, namely saying thank you and being able to adjust to the environment. The facts show that even though it is a bit old, early childhood always say thank you for receiving something from someone else. If the person giving something is an adult, then the thank you is accompanied by kissing the hand of the giver. In terms of adjustment, early childhood in ECE Al Qorny is a bit difficult. It can be assumed that the nature of early childhood tends to refrain from new situations encountered. Is it in the face of a new atmosphere or meeting new people who he knows?

## 5 CONCLUSION

Based on the results of the discussion and discussion in this study, it can be concluded that; (1) Al Qorny's Early Childhood Education Institution was established to fulfill the government program of one ECE village, which in Jakarta was adapted to become one ECE. (2) The organizer of Al Qorny ECE has not fulfilled the educational qualification requirements required to educate early childhood, namely at least a bachelor's education in the field of early childhood education but given the needs of residents who want an early childhood education institution in the district, the Al Qorny ECE established. (3) The transformation of tolerance values among religious people is explicitly not taught in ECE Al Qorny on the grounds that all students are of the same religion. (4) The transformation of tolerance values between religious communities is taught through learning that is integrated with other lessons, for example in learning English. (5) Although explicitly the values of tolerance between religions are not taught, but the values of togetherness such as saying good morning or good afternoon, sharing something that is owned, and helping the needs of others, are taught with at the same time practiced.

Referring to the conclusions above, it can be stated that the implication of this research is that even in an educational institution (ECE) where students have the same religion, it still needs to be taught or informed the values of tolerance between religious communities. Thus, children will

experience a habit of being tolerant between religious communities from an early age. This research can be carried out at the expense of the Jakarta State University Postgraduate Program as well as the policies of the leadership of the Jakarta State University. For all that, the researcher would like to thank, hoping that this research can be useful for the study of religious tolerance in Indonesia.

## 6 REFERENCES

- Adams, K. (2019). Navigating the spaces of children's spiritual experiences: influences of tradition(s), multidisciplinary and perceptions. *International Journal of Children's Spirituality*, 24(1), 29–43. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1364436X.2019.1619531>
- Adams, K., Bull, R., & Maynes, M. L. (2016). Early childhood spirituality in education: Towards an understanding of the distinctive features of young children's spirituality. *European Early Childhood Education Research Journal*, 24(5), 760–774. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1350293X.2014.996425>
- Atamturk, N. (2018). The role of English as a foreign language classes in tolerance education in relation to school management practices. *Quality and Quantity*, 52, 1167–1177. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11135-017-0575-7>
- Banerjee, K., & Bloom, P. (2015). "Everything Happens for a Reason": Children's Beliefs About Purpose in Life Events. *Child Development*, 86(2), 503–518. <https://doi.org/10.1111/cdev.12312>
- Bano, M., & Ferra, E. (2018). Family versus school effect on individual religiosity: Evidence from Pakistan. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 59(August 2017), 35–42. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2017.10.015>
- Coleman, E. B., & Eds, K. W. (2011). Religious Tolerance, Education and the Curriculum. In *Religious Tolerance, Education and the Curriculum*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-6091-412-6>
- Elza, Y., Handini, M. C., & Abdurrahman, M. (2018). The Effects of Storytelling Method with Audiovisual Media and Religiosity toward Clean and Healthy Living Program Behaviour (CHLB) of Early Childhood. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary and Current Research*, 6(June), 547–552.
- Ene, I., & Barna, I. (2015). Religious Education and Teachers' Role in Students' Formation towards Social Integration. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 180(November 2014), 30–35. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.02.081>
- Ergun, S. J., & Rivas, M. F. (2019). The effect of social roles, religiosity, and values on climate change concern: An empirical analysis for Turkey. *Sustainable Development*, 27(4), 758–769. <https://doi.org/10.1002/sd.1939>
- Faas, D., Smith, A., & Darmody, M. (2018). Children's Agency in Multi-Belief Settings: The Case of Community National Schools in Ireland. *Journal of Research in Childhood Education*, 32(4), 486–500. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02568543.2018.1494645>
- Firdaus, E. (2018). The Learning of Religious Tolerance among Students in Indonesia from the Perspective of Critical Study. *IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science*, 145(1). <https://doi.org/10.1088/1755-1315/145/1/012032>
- Ganjvar, M. (2019). Islamic Model of Children's Spiritual Education (CSE); its influence on improvement of communicational behaviour with non-coreligionists. *International Journal of Children's Spirituality*, 24(2), 124–139. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1364436X.2019.1624254>
- Granqvist, P., & Nkara, F. (2017). Nature meets nurture in religious and spiritual development.

- British Journal of Developmental Psychology*, 35(1), 142–155.  
<https://doi.org/10.1111/bjdp.12170>
- Heiphetz, L., Lane, J. D., Waytz, A., & Young, L. L. (2016). How Children and Adults Represent God's Mind. *Cognitive Science*, 40(1), 121–144. <https://doi.org/10.1111/cogs.12232>
- King, U. (2013). The spiritual potential of childhood: Awakening to the fullness of life. *International Journal of Children's Spirituality*, 18(1), 4–17.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/1364436X.2013.776266>
- Kirschenbaum, H. (2019). *Models of Values Education and Moral Education in the Era of the Fourth Industrial Revolution*. 8(2), 103–109.
- Lehtonen, M. (2019). The Development of Religious Tolerance: Co-operative Board Games with Children and Adolescents. *IATL Reinvention: An International Journal of Undergraduate Research*, 2(2). Retrieved from [https://warwick.ac.uk/fac/cross\\_fac/iatl/reinvention/](https://warwick.ac.uk/fac/cross_fac/iatl/reinvention/)
- Łowicki, P., & Zajenkowski, M. (2019). Empathy and Exposure to Credible Religious Acts during Childhood Independently Predict Religiosity. *International Journal for the Psychology of Religion*, 00(00), 1–14. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10508619.2019.1672486>
- Maussen, M., Bader, V., Dobbernack, J., Modood, T., Olsen, T. V., Fox, J., & Vidra, Z. (2012). *Tolerance and cultural diversity in schools Comparative report*. Amsterdam.
- Miedema, S., & Bertram-Troost, G. (2008). Democratic citizenship and religious education: Challenges and perspectives for schools in the Netherlands. *British Journal of Religious Education*, 30(2), 123–132. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01416200701830970>
- Moore, D. . (2007). *Overcoming Religious Illiteracy: A Cultural Studies Approach to the Study of Religion in Secondary Education*. US: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Niculescu, R. M., & Norel, M. (2013). Religious Education an Important Dimension of Human's Education. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 93, 338–342.  
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2013.09.200>
- Pandya, S. P. (2019). Spiritual education programme (SEP) for enhancing the quality of life of kindergarten school children. *Pastoral Care in Education*, 37(1), 59–72.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/02643944.2018.1562493>
- Parekh, B. (2019). Ethnocentric Political Theory. *Ethnocentric Political Theory*, 263–284.  
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-11708-5>
- Sari, A. D. P., & Indartono, S. (2019). *Teaching Religious Tolerance Through Social Studies Education Based On Multicultural Approach*. 323(ICoSSCE 2018), 214–219.  
<https://doi.org/10.2991/icossce-icsmc-18.2019.40>
- Scheiner, P. (2015). *Crossings and Crosses: Borders, Educations, and Religions in Northern Europe*. Boston/Berlin: Walter de Gruyter Inc.
- Scott, K. (2014). Inviting young adults to come out religiously, institutionally and traditionally. *Religious Education*, 109(4), 471–484. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00344087.2014.924790>
- Stockinger, H. (2019). Developing spirituality—an equal right of every child? *International Journal of Children's Spirituality*, 24(3), 307–319.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/1364436X.2019.1646218>
- Thibodeau, R. B., Brown, M. M., Nancarrow, A. F., Elpers, K. E., & Gilpin, A. T. (2018). Conceptual Similarities among Fantasy and Religious Orientations: A Developmental Perspective. *Journal of Cognition and Culture*, 18(1–2), 31–46.  
<https://doi.org/10.1163/15685373-12340021>
- Tratner, A. E., Sela, Y., Lopes, G. S., Ehrke, A. D., Weekes-Shackelford, V. A., & Shackelford,

- T. K. (2017). Individual differences in childhood religious experiences with peers. *Personality and Individual Differences*, 119, 73–77. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.paid.2017.06.045>
- UNESCO. (2015). *Second UNESCO Forum on Global Citizenship Education: Building Peaceful and Sustainable Societies (Paris, 28-30 January 2015). Final Report*. (January), 1–22. Retrieved from [http://www.unesco.org/new/fileadmin/MULTIMEDIA/HQ/ED/pdf/FinalReport-GCED\\_21April.pdf](http://www.unesco.org/new/fileadmin/MULTIMEDIA/HQ/ED/pdf/FinalReport-GCED_21April.pdf)
- Uzefovsky, F., Döring, A. K., & Knafo-Noam, A. (2016). Values in Middle Childhood: Social and Genetic Contributions. *Social Development*, 25(3), 482–502. <https://doi.org/10.1111/sode.12155>
- Van Der Walt, J. L. (2014). Towards an instrument for measuring religious tolerance among educators and their students worldwide (Potchefstroom Campus-North-West University). Retrieved from <https://www.driestar-educatief.nl/medialibrary/Driestar/Engelse-website/Documenten/2014-VanderWalt-Measuring-religious-tolerance-in-education.pdf>
- Yulianti, E., Sutarto, J., & Sugiyo. (2019). Sentra Nasima Learning Strategies to Enhance Religious Nationalist Characters in Kindergarten. *Journal of Primary Education*, 8(69), 238–247.