



A Learning Development of Beauty Skill Program at A Vocational School in Preserving Local Wisdom

Otin Martini¹, Engkus Kuswarno², M. Andriana Gaffar³, Rianti Cahyani⁴.

Post Graduate School, Universitas Islam Nusantara, Indonesia
Jl. Soekarno-Hatta No. 530 Bandung, Indonesia

Abstract

Received: September 2, 2021
Revised: December 30, 2021
Accepted: December 30, 2021

A Learning Development of Beauty Skill Program at A Vocational School in Preserving Local Wisdom. **Objectives:** The research is to analyze the learning development of beauty skill program at a vocational school in preserving local wisdom. **Methods:** to employ a qualitative approach with an analytically descriptive method towards two-state vocational schools in *Kabupaten* Bandung and Bandung city. Library research, in-depth interviews, a document study and observation were carried out to gather data. Informants were chosen by using a snowball technique, the findings, then, were examined and analyzed by using management theory by Deming, curriculum theory of social reconstruction and learning theory of constructivism by Vygotsky. **Findings:** Learning development planning of beauty skill at a vocation school in preserving local wisdom is designed by formulating vision and mission, arranging curriculum, providing more productive teachers and improving learning facilities. Learning development implementation is made by achieving student's competence, involving experts and industrial and business world. Learning development is supervised by the Department of Education, Branch Department of Education West Java Provincial Government and school superintendent. The problem faced in learning development is the lack of productive subject time allotment, human resources and qualified teachers understanding local wisdom. The improvement is by enhancing industrial and business world cooperation and teaching factory, collaborating with professional, experts and practitioner organization, using subject time allotment and extracurricular activities. **Conclusion:** By learning development of beauty skill program in preserving local wisdom, it affects the quality improvement of graduates who have high awareness towards local wisdom, educational service improvement and the achievement of learning development implementation and the learning quality improvement.

Keywords: learning development, education management, local wisdom

(*) Corresponding Author: martini.otin.s3@gmail.com

How to Cite: Otin Martini, Engkus Kuswarno, Engkus Kuswarno, M. Andriana Gaffar, & Rianti Cahyani. (2021). A Learning Development Of Beauty Skill Program At A Vocational School In Preserving Local Wisdom. *JTP - Jurnal Teknologi Pendidikan*, 23(3), 321-331. <https://doi.org/10.21009/jtp.v23i3.22826>



INTRODUCTION

In the fourth wave of the industrial revolution or well known as the 4.0 industrial revolution, vocational education in Indonesia is facing global and national challenges. In a global challenge, vocational education has a problem with graduate's competitiveness. The implementation of the ASEAN Economic Community opens foreigners' opportunities to work in Indonesia. In a national challenge, the job opportunity is limited while the industrial and business world expects the graduate to have a high skill. In this situation, the vocational graduates give the high number of unemployment about 8.63% (BPS, 2020).

Overcoming the stagnancy of vocational graduates' quality, the government improves the relevancy of vocational education and the industrial and business world by issuing the instructional presidency no 9 of 2016 about vocational school revitalization. It happens because there is a mismatch between skills taught in vocational schools and the industrial and business world (Handel, 2014; Hersch, 2012). The link and match policy is revitalized. Mismatch occurs because the vocational school does not follow the industrial and business need (Sloane, 2013; Boudarbat and Chernoff, 2015).

Education in vocational school is currently viewed as a human investment that has added value. People's awareness about the importance of education is increased as the tight competition in the global era (Thune, 2001) and the effort in social status mobility through knowledge, technology, and financial competitiveness (Darling, 2005). The people's awareness toward education is responded by improving vocational performance by considering the complexity and change of demand toward vocational school, accountability in school governance, and a graduate quality being accepted in the industrial and business world (Olssen, 2004).

In maintaining the vocational existence, vocational schools use local wisdom as one of uniqueness in responding to global and national challenges. The local wisdom is preserved by vocational schools by modifying subjects in beauty skill programs. National Educational System Bill No. 20 of 2003 states that education-based society is education that is presented based on religion, social, culture, and community potential as a form of education from, by, and for people. The bill indicates that the education-based local wisdom is an education taking benefits from economy, culture, language, and technology for students' competence development (Ma'mur, 2012).

The school has an interest in preserving local wisdom. A pearl of local wisdom is still maintained when people apply norms, views, and values. The cultural development and global trends make local wisdom be ignored and forgotten. Local wisdom is eventually seen as a symbolic meaning and heritage without understanding the deep and true meaning of the wisdom. Learning development is needed as a purpose of preserving and inheriting the local wisdom in the context of the beauty skill program. Then, students do not only have skills but also have adequate knowledge in narrating local wisdom in beauty skills.

Previous research about the learning development of beauty skill programs in vocational schools is conducted by Putri (2019). The research stated that learning development by combining digital technology and local wisdom grows students' creativity and imagination. Another research was carried out by Sari and Sipahutar (2014). The research indicates eight components are mastered by students. They are self-concept, creativity, innovation, initiative, aesthetic, diligence, passion, and persistence. Rangkuti, Sitompul, and Simbolon (2018) state that using video as a learning medium makes students have a good learning result. Mandalika (2020) in the research concludes that tutorial video using as learning media result in effective learning media for students in the learning process. The use of media increases the use of time in the learning process. Sukarsi (2014) states interactive multimedia in beauty skill programs increases students' learning

creativity. Sarwendah (2015) states that the students' competence is improved when traditional values are introduced in contemporary bridal makeup.

Literature indicates that Deming's management theory promotes the plan, do, check, and act cycle which is well-recognized as PDCA (Salis, 2002). The purpose of the Deming management theory is the result achieved by the institution is to satisfy the customers. The Deming management stresses out continuous improvement. In the context of education, the management is aimed at increasing the quality of input, process, output, and outcome. The theory of social reconstruction used in the research has a deep attention to a social problem (Hamalik, 2006). This curriculum is triggered by the gap between the school curriculum and society. From the curriculum perspective, a school curriculum is a life in society. In the social reconstruction curriculum, there are three curriculum sources, such as knowledge, society, and students (Subandijah, 1996). People are one of the curriculum sources, then school is an educational institution in conserving local wisdom since the local wisdom grows in society.

In the perspective of constructivism learning theory by Vygotsky, every student develops based on social context. An intellectual development including meaning, thought, memory, perception, and consciousness move from interpersonal to intrapersonal. The mechanism-based high-order thinking skills are connected to social interaction (Slavin, 2000). In Vygotsky's perspective, high-level cognitive work in a human being has social interaction background in certain cultural contexts (Bruning, 1995). Cognition is the self-internalization of social interaction. Social cognition theory from Vygotsky requires the social foundation to understand the process of education. Vygotsky, then, insists on the importance of cultural environment and social interaction in human development (Slavin, 2000).

The research in the learning development of beauty skill programs in preserving local wisdom needs to be conducted because the vocational school focuses on the hard skills such as bridal makeup, hair color treatment, skincare, without creatively exploring the uniqueness of local wisdom in treating the beauty treatment. The Industrial and business world need skillful and unique graduates to respond the people demand. Then, understanding students towards local wisdom is urgently required. To create qualified graduates in local wisdom understanding, research on learning development is needed. The novelty of the research shows in learning development in beauty skill programs accommodates the local wisdom to craft the qualified graduate. Having vocational graduates who know local wisdom better is expected to decrease the number of vocational school graduates unemployed.

The research attempts to analyze the learning development of beauty skill programs at a vocational school in preserving local wisdom. More specifically, the research questions are: how learning development in beauty skill programs at vocational schools in preserving local wisdom is planned, implemented, and controlled? What are the obstacles found in the learning development? How is the improvement conducted in the learning development?

METHOD

Research Design

The research carried out a qualitative approach which is focused on describing and analyzing a person or people's phenomena, events, social activity, attitude, beliefs, thoughts (Creswell, 2007). To find out empirical data, the research employed an analytically descriptive method. The method was employed to investigate the natural condition of the object. The researcher became the key instrument and the data gathered were inductively used and emphasized meaning rather than generalization (Moleong, 2001). This research was conducted in two favorite vocational schools, namely SMK

Negeri 2 Baleendah Kabupaten Bandung and SMK Negeri 9 Kota Bandung. The two vocational schools were chosen because they have a beauty skill program. The research was conducted from February until June 2021. The in-depth interview was performed towards all participants and combined with observation, and documents study.

Participants

The number of participants involved in the research was 13 people, including two vocational school principals, two chair people of the study program, two teachers, two students, and four leaders of professional organizations. The participants were chosen by using a snowball technique. All participants were women. 11 participants had professional licenses or certificates and spent more than 25-year experience in vocational education, particularly in beauty skills. The professional organization was *Persatuan Ahli Kecantikan dan Pengusaha Salon Indonesia* (association of Indonesia beauty expert and beauty parlor owner) “*Tiara Kusuma*”, *Himpunan Ahli Rias Pengantin Indonesia Provinsi Jawa Barat* (Association of Indonesia Bridal Makeup expert West Java Province). Two leaders were practitioners who were in charge in *Tempat Uji Kompetensi (Competency Assessment Center)* Ariyanti and Lestari.

Procedures

Procedures to perform the research in qualitative approach were proceeded since collecting data in the object research was started. The researcher was concerned with the focus and the objective of the research observed and took notes on the important events, such as students-teachers interaction, principal-teachers meetings, classroom activities, collected important documents, identified and classified the data, analyzed and interpreted the data, and drew the conclusion.

Since the researcher was a key instrument to collect the data. The data gathered were credible, transferable, dependable, and confirmable (Sugiyono, 2010). The technique of data collection was performed in a natural setting. The observation was conducted to gather the data by examining the ongoing activities (Sukmadinata, 2007). Teaching-learning activities were observed. The researcher was also involved in students’ activities both in classroom and extracurricular, the principal and teacher’s meeting. The data finding from observation was noted and administered.

The in-depth interviews were performed based on the procedures: (1). Determine the person to be informant; (2). Set the main problem to be clarified; (3). Open the interview; (4). Perform the interview; (5). Confirm the interview summary; (6). Write the interview result in field note documents; (7) Identify and follow up the interview result.

The data were also gathered from the documents. The document study was aimed at gathering the data in the form of vocational school policy or evidence. The documents were identified and examined. The data finding from the school’s documents was administered in the field note documentation.

Data Analysis

The data analyzed for this research emanate from interviews with participants, observation, and documents. Data collected from the interviews were analyzed using Mile and Huberman’s (1992) framework, ranging from reducing the interview text, making verification to concluding. The data in Bahasa Indonesia were translated into English for this manuscript. The analysis was using the theory of Deming management, curriculum social reconstruction, and Vygotsky learning theory.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

From the interviews and document study, it is found that learning development of beauty skill program in two vocational schools has three stages: (1) planning; (2) doing, and (3) controlling. Besides, schools are facing obstacles and the way to overcome the problems.

Planning, Implementing, and Controlling of Learning Development

As the changing wave hits human life, the vocational schools should surf the challenging wave, changing the threat to opportunity. The unpredictable situation should be answered by tightening the quality commitment. In 21 century, vocational schools tend to involve with high global competition. Vocational school graduates will compete with national, regional, and global graduates.

In the context of global culture in Indonesia and the awareness in improving quality and competitiveness, learning development plays a significant role in enhancing the educational quality. Vocational school has an interest in preserving local wisdom to the students. Even though the subjects refer to the national curriculum, the subject links the national curriculum and the school's vision and mission. The school vision and mission are based on local wisdom.

The management in learning development in preserving local wisdom is by planning, implementing, and controlling as summarized in table 1.

Tabel 1. Interview Summary about Planning, Implementing and Controlling

No	Dimension	SMK Negeri 9 Kota Bandung	SMK Negeri 2 Baleendah
1	Planning	a. Analyzing curriculum. Integrating with relevant subject, formulating integrated model of local wisdom.	a. Analyzing basic competence, hair treatment can be embedded in local wisdom, preparing the topic lesson, collaborating with industrial and business world.
		b. Starting with class X, synchronizing with beauty skill subject (skin and facial treatment), inserting in productivity and creativity subject.	b. Analyzing relevant materials of beauty skill, understanding local wisdom.
		c. Inserting local wisdom in every beauty subjects, such as makeup, hair dressing, and bridal makeup.	c. Local wisdom can be put in traditional and creative hairdresser (<i>sanggul</i>). Understanding the purpose of learning development.
2	Implementing	a. Implementing local wisdom in the curriculum, syllabus and teaching in hair dresser subject.	a. Using information technology effectively. Completing teacher's support systems and learning facilities.
		b. Students learn by themselves form the internet. The curriculum is adjusted with Indonesian National Qualification framework.	b. Using traditional materials, making learning subject.

		Learning development is by strengthening the curriculum.	
		c. Implementation is based on school vision and mission. The implementation is for graduates competitiveness. Collaboration with professional organization.	c. Implementing the planning, collaboration with business and industrial world, practitioners and experts.
3	Controlling	West Java government	School Principal, vice school principal and chief study program.

Table 1 shows that the learning development of the beauty skills program started with the analysis of curriculum, topic in the subjects, and support systems such as facilities and stakeholders' involvement. However, in the perspective of Deming, the stages performed by schools are not designed in the continuous improvement cycles as the PDCA cycle. From document study, vocational schools do not provide standard operating procedures in executing from stage to stage. That is why, the activities in every steps performed by SMK Negeri 9 Kota Bandung and SMK Negeri 2 Baleendah Kabupaten are different.

In PDCA cycles, the plan is used to the next step (do). Do is used for check. Check is for Act. Table 1 shows that the activities in implementing step have nothing to do with the planning step. The activities in controlling do not influence the planning. For instance, the West Java government controls SMKN 9 Bandung. In the planning step, the government is not included in the school's activities. The planning activities are not followed up in the implementation. In SMK Negeri 2 Baleendah, one of the planning activities is analyzing basic competence. However, in the next step, information technology is used which was never discussed in the planning step.

Learning development of beauty skill program should be started by formulating school vision and mission in preserving local wisdom. When the school vision and mission are designed based on the skill programs and considered to preserve local wisdom, then the curriculum can be adjusted to be a similar focus with the school vision and mission. Teachers, accompanied by experts and stakeholders, identified the relevant topic of subjects to be inserted into the local wisdom.

In the implementation, learning development will avoid students learning by themselves, browsing social media without the teacher's guidance. Student-centered learning requires teachers to facilitate students to be more critical. Students investigate materials in social media because students know what they should do. Any problems found in investigating will be discussed in classroom activities with their friends and teacher. As 21st-century life skills should be mastered by students, the teacher expands the horizon by inviting guest teachers from the business and industrial world to speak in front of students. The local wisdom is delivered by the guest teachers. Then, the collaboration between vocational schools and stakeholders is urgently needed.

Learning development components can be observed in table. 2.

Table 2. Learning Development Matrix

G	Learning Development			
	Existing Condition		Expected Condition	
Planning	School vision and mission	School vision and mission in SMKN 9 Bandung and SMKN 2 Baleendah are still	School vision and mission	School vision and mission are designed based on skill

		too general, not focus on skill programs.		programs, particularly beauty skill program to preserve local wisdom.
	Curriculum	Curriculum is designed based on national, regional and skill contents.	Curriculum	Curriculum is designed based on national, regional and skill contents which are linked with local wisdom. The curriculum is adjusted with business and industrial world.
	Human Resource	Lack of productive teachers and incompetent.	Human Resource	Provide more teachers and improve teacher's competence.
	Facilities	Lack of facilities in supporting productive and practical subjects which are in line with local wisdom.	Facilities	Complete more facilities which meet learning need particularly learning facilities and in line with local wisdom.
	Material	The material is based on national curriculum. The material has not been developed yet in preserving local wisdom.	Material	Material is designed to achieve the national curriculum target by developing teachers' competence to preserve local wisdom.
Implementing	Industrial and business world	The industrial and business world have not been involved in learning development.	Industrial and business world	Industrial and business world needs to be involved in learning development in preserving local wisdom.
	Experts	The experts have not been involved in	Experts	The experts need to be involved in

		learning development.		learning development in preserving local wisdom.
	Development	West Java government, Department of Education, school superintendents.	Development	West Java government, Department of Education, school superintendents by focusing on learning development in preserving local wisdom.
	Supervision	Principal supervises teachers every semester.	Supervision	Principal supervises teachers every semester by concerning with learning development in preserving local wisdom.
Controlling				
	Evaluation	Schools have not regularly conducted evaluation. Schools conducted competence assessment through <i>Lembaga Sertifikasi Profesi (LSP) P1</i> .	Evaluation	Schools need to regularly evaluate learning development in preserving local wisdoms. Competence assessment is performed by LSP P1, P2 and P3 and <i>Lembaga Sertifikasi Kompetensi</i> .

Table 2 shows that learning development is an expected condition in vocational schools. Learning development of beauty skill program in preserving local wisdom begins with the formulation of school vision and mission. The school vision statement will be acknowledged by school members. Since learning development has a strong relation with curriculum, the curriculum is adjusted. Local wisdom is put in certain subjects. The limitation of time allotment is solved by using extracurricular and intracurricular activities. The number of teachers is limited. The vocational schools should provide more qualified teachers who have the capacity in presenting local wisdom. The facilities should be improved to support the learning development. Vocational schools can provide a local wisdom laboratory which students can learn in the laboratory.

In the implementation, the planning programs are applied. The materials are presented in teaching activities. The collaboration between schools and the business and

industrial world is organized. The experts are involved in school activities. The learning development of beauty skills program is not only in micro activities like teaching and learning, but also it is about how to break the vision down into the teaching material. Hopefully, the local wisdom is not merely a symbol, but it can be shared with students.

In controlling, as a public school, vocational schools are ready to be monitored by stakeholders. External evaluators are the West Java government, the Branch Department of Education, and superintendents. A principal becomes a person who is responsible for the institution. A principal should make sure that teachers are ready for improvements. Students in the final level are assessed by *Lembaga Sertifikasi Profesi* (Professional Certification Institution) and *Lembaga Sertifikasi Kompetensi* (Competence Certification Institution). In short, the quality assurance system is established by involving certification institutions to assess the vocational graduates' competence.

Obstacles and Improvement of Learning Development

The obstacles and improvements are two sides of a coin. When the problems appear, then the vocational schools should attempt to find the solution. Table 3 describes the obstacles and improvement of learning development.

Tabel 3. Interview Summary about Obstacles and Improvements

No	Dimension	SMK Negeri 9 Kota Bandung	SMK Negeri 2 Baleendah
1	Obstacles	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Lack of teachers' competence, students interest and learning facilities and materials. b. <i>Sanggul accessories</i> are difficult to get, students are lack references/information. Local wisdom is not popular. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Lack of traditional accessories, people are influenced by western culture. b. Lack of teachers, insufficient time, lack of students' interest. Local wisdom is not easy to find in social media.
2	Improvements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Teachers' and students competence development. b. Curriculum development. c. Add subjects, prepare the learning materials. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Provide learning media, arranging local wisdom based curriculum. b. Collaboration with professional organization. c. Inviting guest teacher, improving teachers' competence, involving stakeholders and completing school's facilities.

From table 3, the teachers' competence, students' interest and the difficulty of getting traditional accessories become the main obstacles in learning development. The improvements to overcome the obstacles are by encouraging teachers and students to improve their competence. Vocational Schools provide sufficient learning media to accommodate the local wisdom curriculum. The curriculum is adjusted by involving professional organizations and experts. The curriculum design can accommodate a school vision and also the national interests. Vocational schools are also making innovative programs to get closer to the business and industrial worlds. Inviting guest teachers from a company, traditional wedding organization, or local wisdom activists. They are invited by teachers to share their experiences, knowledge, and values, students can get many resources from the events.

Learning development of beauty skills in preserving local wisdom can be employed to overcome the problems and set the improvements. The continuous improvement in learning development can be performed by enhancing industrial and business world cooperation and teaching factory, collaborating with professional, experts and practitioner organization, using subject time allotment and extracurricular activities.

CONCLUSION

After discussing the findings, the research comes up with several conclusions. First, to improve the vocational school graduate's competitiveness in beauty skill program, learning development of beauty skill program in preserving local wisdom is combined with the national curriculum. Second, conducting the learning development in preserving local wisdom is considered the good governance in planning, implementing, and controlling. Third, the lack of teacher's competence, student's interest, facilities, are the main obstacle in learning development. Fourth, innovative programs, curriculum modification, and business and industrial world, experts and professional organization involvement improve the learning development of beauty skill programs.

Further research needs to be done in the level of the macro level of education in relation to vocational education policy since the vocational school does not have a big room to modify the curriculum.

REFERENCES

- Boudarbat, B., & Chernoff, V. (2015). The Determinants of Education-Job Match among Canadian University Graduates. *IZA Discussion Paper*, 43(6), 781–793. Retrieved from <https://www.iza.org/publications/dp/4513/the-determinants-of-education-job-match-among-canadian-university-graduates>.
- BPS. (2020). *Pendapatan Nasional Indonesia 2016-2020*. Jakarta: BPS RI.
- Brunning R.H., Schraw, G.J., & Ronning, R.R. (1995). *Cognitive Psychology and Instruction*, Edisi 2, Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Creswell, John W. (2007). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design, Second Edition*. California: Sage Publication.
- Darling, L. Hammond. (2005). *Preparing Teacher for a Changing world, What Teachers should learn and be able to do*. San Francisco; Jossey -Bass.
- Hamalik, Oemar. (2006). *Manajemen Pengembangan Kurikulum*. Bandung: PT. Remaja Rosda Karya.
- Handel, M. J. (2014). Skills Mismatch in the Labor Market. *Annual Review of Sociologi JSTOR*, 29(135), 65 –76. doi.org/10.1146/annurev.soc.29.010202.100030
- Hersch, J. (2012). Education Match and Job Match. *The Review of Economics and Statistics* 73(1), 650–664. Retrieved from <https://econpapers.repec.org/RePEc:tpr:restat:v:73:y:1991:i:1:p:140-44>
- Ma'mur, Asmani Jamal. (2012). *Buku Panduan Internalisasi Pendidikan Karakter di Sekolah*. Yogyakarta : Diva Press.
- Mandalika, Syahril (2020). Pengembangan Media Pembelajaran Berbasis Video Tutorial Untuk Meningkatkan Efektifitas Pembelajaran Pada Mata Kuliah Tata Rias Pengantin Indonesia. *INVOTEK Vol 20 No 1*. <https://doi.org/10.24036/invotek.v20i1.725>
- Miles, Matthew dan Huberman, A. Michael. (1992). *Analisis Data Kualitatif: Buku Sumber Tentang Metode-Metode Baru*. Jakarta: UI Press.
- Moleong, Lexi J. (2001). *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Olssen, Mark. (2004). *Education Policy: Globalization, Citizenship and Democracy*. London Sage Publications.
- Putri, Astriani Eka. (2019). Analisis Kebutuhan Bahan Ajar Berbasis Literasi Digital Nilai-Nilai Kearifan Lokal pada Tradisi Saprahan di Pontianak. *Yupa: Historical Studies Journal* Vol. 3 No. 1, 2019 (1-7). <https://doi.org/10.30872/yupa.v3i1.132>
- Rangkuti, Irmiah Nurul, Sitompul, Harun, Simbolon, Naeklan. (2018). Pengembangan Media Video Pembelajaran Rias Karakter Pada Program Studi Pendidikan Tata Rias.

- Jurnal Teknologi Informasi dan Komunikasi dalam Pendidikan*. Vol.5, No. 1.
<https://doi.org/10.24114/jtikp.v5i1.12520>
- Salis, Edward. (2002). *Total Quality Management in Education*. London: Kogan Page Ltd.
- Sari, Dian Maya dan Sipahutar, Esther Restie. (2014). Pengembangan Media Pembelajaran Interaktif Berbasis Blog Rias Wajah Sehari-Hari Tata Kecantikan Kulit. *Jurnal Teknologi Informasi dan Komunikasi dalam Pendidikan*. Vol 1, No.1.
<https://doi.org/10.24114/jtikp.v1i1.1870>
- Sarwendah, Zesi Zarmasi. (2016). Manifestasi Nilai Tradisional Riasan Pengantin. Kontemporer Dalam Mata Pelajaran Tata Rias Dan Kecantikan Di SMK. *Keluarga: Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Kesejahteraan Keluarga*. Vol. 2, No. 2. Retrieved from
<https://jurnal.ustjogja.ac.id/index.php/keluarga/article/view/1936>.
- Slavin, R.E. (2000). *Educational Psychology: Theory and Practice*. Boston: Allyn and Bacon.
- Sloane, P. J. (2013). Much Ado About Nothing? What Does The Over-Education Literature Really Tell Us? *Overeducation in Europe: Current Issues in Theory and Policy*, 45(3), 234–254. Retrieved from
<http://www.almalaurea.it/universita/pubblicazioni/wp>
- Subandijah. (1996). *Pengembangan dan Inovasi Kurikulum*. Jakarta: PT. Raja Grafindo Persada.
- Sugiyono. (2010). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif Kualitatif dan R&D*. Bandung: Alfabeta
- Sukarsi, Sri. (2014). Penggunaan Multimedia Interaktif dalam Upaya Meningkatkan Kreativitas Belajar Perawatan Kulit dan Rias Wajah Pada Siswa Kelas X Tata Kecantikan Kulit di SMK Negeri 3 Pati. *Teknobuga*. Vol.1. No. 2.
<https://doi.org/10.15294/teknobuga.v1i2.6414>
- Sukmadinata, Nana Syaodih.(2007), *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan*, Bandung; Rosda Karya.
- Thune, Christian. (2001). *European Network for Quality Assurance in Higher Education*. Helsinki: Multiprint.