The Incorporation of the 4C Skills in The Lesson Plans of Grade Eight

Nadia Luthfi¹, Imas Wahyu Agustina², Hanip Pujiati³
¹,²,³English Language Education Study Program, Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Jakarta, Indonesia

Submitted: 20 Nov 2022
Revised : 25 Feb 2023
Accepted : 30 May 2023

Abstract

This research aimed to investigate the incorporation of the 4C skills in the lesson plans and to analyze how the 4C skills were implemented into the lesson plans of English for grade eight. The data for this qualitative content analysis research was gathered by analyzing ten lesson plans for grade eight of junior high school in Bekasi and Jakarta. The research found that all the lesson plans included all the 4C skills, which comprised 51% of communication skills, 69% of collaboration, 61% of critical thinking, and 69% of creativity. As the most widely incorporated, collaboration and creativity were found in learning and assessment activities. These findings are expected to be a recommendation for scholars, especially English teachers in designing lesson plans that meet 21st-century skill needs.

Keywords:
4C Skills; Collaboration; Communication; Creativity; Critical Thinking; Lesson Plan.

INTRODUCTION

Education has become the main mechanism providing individuals with the knowledge, skills, and competencies needed by the society of the day, but educational provision typically lags behind the emergence of need due to the rapid movement of information sharing and technology advancement. A few changes in classroom design and management can be identified when comparing classrooms of yesteryear and today (Robinson & Aronica, 2015). Education in this era is one of the fields that is expected to produce human resources who have 21st-century skills or competencies. Wagner (2010) identified the competencies and survival skills needed by students in dealing with life, the world of work, and citizenship in the 21st century, emphasizing the following seven (7) skills: (1) critical thinking and problem-solving skills, (2) collaboration and leadership, (3) agility and adaptability, (4) initiative and entrepreneurial spirit, (5) able to communicate effectively both orally and in writing, (6) able to access and analyze information, and (7) have curiosity and imagination.
The Assessment and Teaching of 21st-Century Skills (ATC21S, Griffin, McGaw & Care, 2012) categorize 21st-century skills into four categories: Way of thinking, way of working, tools for working, and skills for living in the world. The way of thinking includes creativity, innovation, critical thinking, problem-solving, and decision-making. The way of working includes skills to communicate, collaborate and work in teams. Tools for working include awareness as global and local citizens, life, career development, and a sense of personal and social responsibility. Meanwhile, skills for living in the world are skills based on information literacy, mastery of information technology and new communications, as well as the ability to learn and work through digital social networks. In line with this, the Partnership for 21st Century Skills (P21, 2019) classifies the competencies needed in the 21st century into four, namely The 4Cs - Communication, Collaboration, Critical Thinking, and Creativity. These competencies are important to be taught to students in the context of core subject areas and 21st-century themes, as Levin-Golberg (2012) highlighted that the 4Cs need to be fully integrated into learning and teaching to produce citizens and employees adequately prepared for the 21st century.

The incorporation of 4C skills into the teaching and learning process has been investigated in recent years. Nevertheless, the focus was mostly on critical thinking skills (Snyder & Snyder, 2008; Terasne & Sugianto, 2019; Wahab & Terasne, 2020; Zhao, Pandian, & Mehar Singh, 2016). Critical thinking has been highlighted due to its role in promoting the higher order of thinking skills in Bloom's Taxonomy (Fadel, Bialik, & Trilling, 2015) and is considered important to develop at schools (Ariyana, Pudjiastuti, Bestary, & Zamromi, 2018). On the other hand, the latest studies on communication, collaborative learning, and creativity were linked with the use of technology, for example, online learning (Oza, 2022), digital comics (Ghofur, 2022), computer-mediated flipped learning (Adhami & Taghizadeh, 2022), and digital storytelling (Belda-Medina, 2021). Those studies captured one or two skills at a time.

A wider coverage was taken into account in the research by Radifan & Dewanti (2020) that analyzed the incorporation of all 4C skills in the senior high school English teachers’ lesson plans. The results suggested that senior secondary English teachers in Indonesia could design lesson plans that incorporate 4C skills despite different development plans in terms of the 4C skills indicators they include, depending on the topic on which they are based. In parallel with that, Tamela & Dwi (2021) conducted research about an analysis of 4C skills integration in the lesson plans of English for grade 7. Some indicators were incorporated in all lesson plans regardless of the topics they had. However, some indicators only appeared in lesson plans which discussed certain topics. These results indicate that even though 4C skills are implemented in all lesson plans, the distribution is not equal. This condition leads to the suggestion that all educators pay attention to the fulfillment of 4C skills in lesson plans so that they can ensure a good start in leading the students to master the required 21st-century skills. A good start can then lead to a more organized implementation of the language learning process in the class.

Considering the previous studies, this present research then aimed to investigate how the 4C skills were incorporated in the English lesson plans for eighth grade, especially to describe the coverage of each skill and the way it is incorporated in the lesson plan. The result of this study is expected to provide a better understanding and an overview of how a teacher can insert all the 4C skills into their lesson plans and raise awareness of designing a well-planned lesson for a better learning process and outcomes.

RESEARCH METHOD

Content analysis was adopted in this study since the researchers analyzed or examined the value of content obtained as data during the study phase (Smulowitz, 2017). It allows the researchers to quantify and analyze the existence, meaning, and relationships of such words, topics, or concepts. This method takes place over a period, starting with formulating the objective, collecting the data, analyzing the data, and describing the findings. The data were taken from the core activities part, sourced from ten lesson plans used in public and private schools around Jakarta and Bekasi. Each of the data was given a code, for instance, LP 1, LP 2, LP 3, etc. Each was then analyzed according to the 4C skill indicators adapted from various previous references. Communication skills were adapted from Hall (2013), Collaboration skills were adapted from Lai, Emily. DiCerbo, Kristen, Foltz, & Peter (2017), Fadel et al. (2015), and Metusalem, Belenky, & DiCerbo (2017), Critical Thinking Skills were adapted from Ariyana et al. (2018), Fadel et al. (2015), Kivunja (2014), Ventura, Lai, & DiCerbo (2017), and Zhao et al. (2016), and lastly Creativity Skills were adapted from Fadel et al. (2015), Kivunja (2014), and Lai, Yarbro, DiCerbo, & Geest (2018).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

A. Results

1. Communication Skills

Table 2 below shows the analysis results of the Communication Skills.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Incorporation in Lesson Plans</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>LP 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Involve collaborative tasks (using speaking, writing, listening, and reading).</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Incorporate peer feedback</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Utilize role-play in teaching interpersonal communication</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>Have students reflect on their project</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Explicitly teach and assess communication skills for modern digital channels.</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f.</td>
<td>Teach students to recognize and count on cultural differences in communicative norms.</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g.</td>
<td>Incorporate the assessment of communication skills (production, reception, intercultural).</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: Analysis Results of the Communication Skills

It shows that three indicators of communication skills are incorporated into all lesson plans despite the topic discussed in them. They are indicators 1. a., 1. e., and 1. g. The following sentences illustrate the findings of indicator 1. a.

Secara berpasangan peserta didik melengkapi dialog rumpang yang melibatkan ungkapan meminta perhatian dan menegecek pemahaman dan responsnya lalu memeragakannya (LP 1, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran).

Secara berkelompok, peserta didik mengemukakan pendapat tentang materi tindakan menyaruh, mengajak, dan meminta izin dengan menanggapinya saat presentasi (LP 4, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran).

Below are sample sentences illustrating that the lesson plans explicitly teach and assess communication skills for modern digital channels.

Peserta didik mengamati tayangan terkait materi ungkapan keharusan, larangan dan himbauan (LP 3, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran).
Siswa mengidentifikasi gambar atau tayangan yang diberikan untuk menjawab pertanyaan tentang tindakan menyaruh, mengajak, dan meminta izin (LP 4, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran).

Four lesson plans incorporate peer feedback, two examples of which says that Dapat menerima pendapat teman dan memberikan solusi terhadap permasalahan (LP 2 in Kegiatan Tutor Teman Sebaya) and Menerima pendapat teman dan memberikan solusi (LP 10, in Kegiatan Tutor Teman Sebaya). Another four lesson plans utilize role-play in teaching interpersonal communication, which can be seen in LPs 2, 3, 4, and 10 in Penilaian Pembelajaran, which says Aktivitas role play untuk membaca script, kosakata dan lancar mencapai fungsi sosial, struktur lengkap dan unsur kebahasaan yang sesuai.

Two indicators cannot be identified or incorporated in any of the analyzed lesson plans. Those are the fourth indicator, Have students reflect on their project, and the sixth indicator, Teach students to recognize and count on cultural differences in communicative norms.

It can be concluded that 51% of the communication skill indicators are incorporated into all lesson plans of English for grade eight. It also shows that the more dominant component of lesson plans containing communication skills are the learning activities and learning assessments.

2. Collaboration Skills

The table below shows the analysis results of the Collaboration Skills.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Incorporation in Lesson Plans</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Establish learning objectives for collaboration.</td>
<td>LP 1 ✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Plan for and use group activities as opportunities to reinforce and practice collaboration skills.</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Encourage students in a group to be responsible for their tasks.</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>Allow students to choose which of the defined roles in a task they would like to play, but encourage them to practice playing different roles over time.</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Rotate groups so that students gain experience working with different types of individuals and teams.</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f.</td>
<td>Stimulate interaction during the collaborative activity.</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g.</td>
<td>Engage students in the process of solving complex problems and authentic task activity.</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>h.</td>
<td>Provide and encourage feedback from teachers and peers.</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. Analysis Results of the Collaboration Skills

It points out that four indicators of collaboration skills are incorporated into all lesson plans regardless of the topic discussed in them. They are indicators 2. b., 2. c., 2. f., and 2. g. The following shows the sample results in the lesson plans:

Secara berpasangan, peserta didik melengkapi 2 dialog rampang yang melibatkan ungkapan meminta perhatian dan mengecek pemahaman (LP 1, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran).
Peserta didik dibentuk dalam beberapa kelompok untuk mendiskusikan, mengumpulkan informasi, mempresentasikan ulang dan saling bertukar informasi mengenai fungsi sosial teks interaksi transaksional lisan dan tulis yang melibatkan tindakan memberi dan meminta informasi terkait kemampuan dan kemauan serta melakukan suatu tindakan (LP 2, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran).
Dibentuk dalam kelompok, perserta didik diminta untuk mendiskusikan dan mengumpulkan informasi terkait materi keharusan, larangan, dan himbauan. (LP 3, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran).

Three indicators of collaboration skills are incorporated in some lesson plans. Three lesson plans incorporate the first indicator which is establishing learning objectives for collaboration. Here are some sample findings: Menghargai dan menghayati perilaku jujur, disiplin, tanggung jawab, peduli (toleransi dan gotong royong) santun, percaya diri dalam berinteraksi secara efektif dengan lingkungan sosial dan alam dalam jangkauan pergaulan dan keberadaannya (LP 1, in Kompetensi Inti) and Selama pembelajaran fungsi sosial berlangsung, guru mengamati siswa dalam pembelajaran yang meliputi sikap: nasionalisme, disiplin, rasa percaya diri, berperilaku jujur, tangguh menghadapi masalah tanggung jawab, rasa ingin tahu dan peduli lingkungan (LP 10, in Kegiatan Penilaian).

The results also show that five lesson plans provide opportunities for students to choose the defined roles in a task they would like to play and the teacher’s encouragement for them to practice playing different roles over time. Those lesson plans have topics on asking and giving information about the willingness and ability to do something, giving suggestions, stating rules and obligations, inviting someone to do something, giving instructions, asking permission, creating greeting cards, and also creating memos and announcements. The eighth indicator of collaboration skill is identified in every examined lesson plan except the tenth lesson plan, which has topics on the memo and announcement. The following are the samples that incorporate feedback from teachers and peers.

Guru dan siswa melakukan refleksi terhadap kegiatan pembelajaran dan memberikan tugas yang berkaitan dengan recount text (LP 9, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran).

In contrast, there is one indicator that cannot be identified in any of the analyzed lesson plans. That is the fifth indicator, Rotate groups so that students gain experience working with different types of individuals and teams.

In short, 69% of the collaboration indicators are incorporated in all analyzed lesson plans. Those indicators are more dominantly incorporated into the learning activities than other components of lesson plans.

3. Critical Thinking Skills

The table below shows the analysis results of the Critical Thinking Skills.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Incorporation in Lesson Plans</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Incorporate the teacher's questioning of lower-level and higher-level questions.</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Include instruction in metacognitive methods.</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Include direct instruction in critical thinking skills.</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>Incorporate strategy for group discussion.</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Incorporate strategy for debate.</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f.</td>
<td>Incorporate a strategy for reciprocal peer questioning.</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g.</td>
<td>Implement problem-based learning in a learning model.</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>h.</td>
<td>Include activities involving collaborative learning.</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i.</td>
<td>Include concept mapping tasks.</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>j.</td>
<td>Include assessment indicators based on the cognitive processes of Higher Order Thinking Skills.</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3. Analysis Results of the Critical Thinking Skills

Five indicators of critical thinking skills are incorporated into all lesson plans; they are indicators 3, b, 3, c, d, and h. Here are some of the sample findings:

Denying bimbingan guru, peserta didik merumuskan pertanyaan terkait dengan isi, fungsi sosial, dan struktur teks serta unsur kebahasaan dalam teks yang telah disajikan (LP 1, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran).

Guru memberikan kesempatan pada peserta didik untuk mengidentifikasi sebanyak mungkin pertanyaan yang berkaitan dengan gambar atau tayangan yang disajikan dan akan dijawab melalui kgiatan pembelajaran khususnya pada materi Chapter VIII: There are many people (LP 7, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran).

Peserta didik dibentuk dalam beberapa kelompok untuk saling bertukar informasi mengenai fungsi sosial teks yang disajikan (LP 4 in Kegiatan Pembelajaran).

Peserta didik dalam kelompoknya berdiskusi mengolah data hasil pengamatan dengan cara berdiskusi, mengolah informasi dan mengerjakan soal tentang materi fungsi sosial memberi informasi sesuai dengan yang diharapkan (LP 10, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran).

On the other hand, there is one indicator incorporated in only one lesson plan on topic about recount text, which says: Guru memberikan pertanyaan tentang recount text, 1) what is the purpose of the text, 2) what is the gen structure of the text, 3) based on paragraph 2, the word “it” refers to.... (LP 9, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran). Indicator 3. f is incorporated in five lesson plans, for example Secara berpasangan peserta didik melengkapi dialog rumpang yang melibatkan ungkapan-ungkapan meminta perhatian dan mengecek pemahaman dan responsnya lalu memperagakannya (LP 1, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran) and Rubrik unjuk kerja untuk role-play (LP 2, 3, 4, 10, in Penilaian Pembelajaran). Furthermore, indicator 3. j is found in five lesson plans, for instance Membuat greeting card terkait hari istimewa yang relevan dengan peserta didik saat itu (LP 5, in Tujuan Pembelajaran) and Membuat pengumuman/ pemberitahuan yang lazim dibuat di kelas dan sekolah, untuk kemudian ditempel di dinding kelas (LP 10, in Tujuan Pembelajaran).

Unfortunately, two indicators cannot be identified incorporated in any of the analyzed lesson plans; that is, the fifth indicator, Incorporate strategy for debate, and the ninth indicator, Include concept mapping task.
It can be concluded that 61% of the indicators of critical thinking skills are incorporated in all analyzed lesson plans, most dominantly in the learning activities. There are some indicators more dominantly applied in certain topics. The analysis also shows that teachers tend to plunge into the cognitive process of creating rather than practicing other critical thinking skills, such as analyzing and evaluating. So, teachers should pay more attention to the process of Higher Order Thinking Skills when designing lesson plans.

4. Creativity Skills

The table below shows the analysis results of the Creativity Skills.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Incorporation in Lesson Plans</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>LP 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Incorporate activities conducted out of school or their classroom to increase activity.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Build good and respectful relationships between teachers and learners.</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Involve activities conducted in open-ended, problem-based learning.</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>Incorporate activities in which students can work collaboratively.</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Incorporate role play and or other improvisation activities.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f.</td>
<td>Manages a learning environment that encourages students to solve an authentic, real-world problem and to be inquisitive with an open mind.</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g.</td>
<td>Incorporate the assessment of creativity through divergent thinking, self-report, and or assessment of creative works.</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>h.</td>
<td>Use a defined creativity rubric with separate dimensions for novelty and usefulness.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4. Analysis Results of the Creativity Skills

Five indicators of creativity skills are incorporated into all lesson plans regardless of the topic covered in them; they are indicators 4, b, 4, c, 4, d, 4, f, and 4, g. The following illustrates the findings:

Mempresentasikan hasil kerja kelompok yang ditanggapi oleh kelompok lain (LP 3, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran).
Setelah membuat greeting card, menyampaikan hasil identifikasi persamaan dan perbedaan greeting card (LP 5, in Tujuan Pembelajaran).
Guru dan peserta didik membuat kesimpulan tentang hal-hal yang telah dipelajari terkait fungsi sosial teks interaksi interpersonal lisan dan tulis yang melibatkan tindakan memberi dan meminta informasi terkait kemampuan dan kemauan dan melakukan suatu tindakan (LP 2, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran).
Guru memberikan penghargaan misalnya pujian atau bentuk penghargaan lain yang relevan pada kelompok yang kinerjanya baik (LP 7, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran).
Membuat resume (CREATIVITY) dengan bimbingan guru tentang point-point penting yang muncul dalam kegiatan (LP 10, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran).

Moreover, there are four lesson plans (LPs 2, 3, 4, and 10, in Rubrik Penilaian Pembelajaran) that incorporate role-play and other improvisation activities. Moreover, one lesson plan encourages activities out of school to trigger more creativity, that is Guru memberikan tugas kepada siswa untuk...
membuat kalimat dalam Present Tense disertai foto diri siswa sedang menjaga kebersihan di rumah (LP 6, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran). Yet, there is one indicator that is not incorporated into any lesson plans. That is the last indicator which says, *Use a defined creativity rubric with separate dimensions for novelty and usefulness.*

In total, 69% of creativity skill indicators are incorporated in all analyzed lesson plans, most dominantly in the learning activities.

**B. Discussion**

The ten analyzed lesson plans in this present study incorporate Communication, Collaboration, Critical Thinking, and Creativity, covering on average more than 50% of indicators of each skill, proving that the teachers are aware of the importance of the 4Cs in the learning process so they put the indicators into the lesson plans. Similar results were also found by Tamela & Dwi (2021) when researching the integration of the 4C skills in the English lesson plans of grade 7, revealing that all the analyzed lesson plans incorporated Communication, Collaboration, Critical Thinking, and Creativity skills. Some indicators were incorporated in all lesson plans regardless of the topics, while others only appeared in lesson plans with certain topics. So were the results by Radifan & Dewanti (2020), which analyzed lesson plans written by Senior High Schools English teachers, although the composition of the indicators is not yet evenly distributed. Some indicators are not found in the sample lesson plans indicating an absence or ignorance of the teachers when planning the lesson. Thus, further consideration is needed to find out if those indicators are not that essential for certain levels or if there is a missing point, creating room for improvement of the future lesson plans to prepare the students for the 21st-century changes and challenges and the 5.0 Industrial Revolution as well.

**CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION**

In short, lesson plans for the English subject for the 8th grade of public and private junior high schools in Bekasi and Jakarta incorporate 51% of communication skills indicators, 69% of collaboration indicators, 61% of critical thinking indicators, and 69% of creativity indicators. Those numbers can be categorized as medium to high engagement, indicating that teachers have raised awareness toward the issue of 21st-century skills. The incorporation can be found most dominantly in the learning activities and learning assessments.

It is hoped that the results of this study can bring more concerns among teachers and student teachers to be more well-prepared with the learning plans, making sure that they provide goals and activities to sufficiently support 4C skills as a room for student practice. Due to this study limitation, further studies can be conducted to cover more levels, more areas, more subjects, or other learning components to portray a more accurate profile of the 4Cs practice in the classroom in Indonesia. Each skill of the 4Cs is not always implemented in isolation, which means that investigation can also include its relationship with skill teaching or knowledge broadening. Further studies can also include the 6C skills as the standard keeps developing and adjusting to the latest needs and challenges of each ongoing generation.
REFERENCES


